

# Identifying Challenges and Effective Indicators in Entrepreneurial Attitudes in the Content of Elementary Textbooks: A Qualitative Study

Chamran Ghanbari<sup>1\*</sup>, Manijeh Zakariaei<sup>2</sup>, Javad Naserian<sup>3</sup>

1. PhD student in Educational Sciences, Islamic Azad University of Zanjan Branch, Iran, [Chamran\\_ghanbari@yahoo.com](mailto:Chamran_ghanbari@yahoo.com) (Corresponding Author)
2. Assistant Professor at the Ministry of Educational Sciences, Islamic Azad University of Zanjan Branch, Iran
3. Assistant Professor at the Department of Statistics and Mathematics, Faculty of Engineering and Basic Sciences, Islamic Azad University, Zanjan, Iran

## Abstract

The aim of this study was to identify the challenges and effective indicators in entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of elementary textbooks. The research method is applied in terms of purpose and based on how to collect qualitative data based on semi-structured interviews. The statistical population included all university professors and entrepreneurship experts who selected the interviewees using theoretical purposive sampling method and in the eleventh interview, due to the duplication of the interview text and consensus, the validity of the information was confirmed based on the results of the interviews, 46 categories were extracted, which were classified into 8 main categories, which indicate the challenges in creating entrepreneurial attitudes. Also, 43 categories were extracted in the indicators section, which were selected in the form of 7 main categories as effective indicators in creating entrepreneurial attitudes. The results showed that the challenges of lack of space and educational context, theorizing of concepts, neglect of entrepreneurship, lack of education, optional activities, lack of evaluation, lack of support from officials and lack of skills of teachers as the most important challenges of not developing attitudes, respectively. Entrepreneurship was introduced in the textbooks of the course. Also, indicators of creating and creating opportunities, self-efficacy, desire and confidence in success, talent identification, participation and interaction, operationalization and acquisition of skills, flexibility of officials were selected as the most important factors in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school textbook content.

**Keywords:** Content Analysis, Textbooks, Elementary School, Entrepreneurship

## Introduction

Scientists have introduced the 21st century as the century of knowledge. In this age, the main capital of societies is their knowledge, management, skills and attitude of human resources. In order for this capital to serve the well-being of society, we need entrepreneurial capabilities (Jahanian, 2010). Because the spirit of entrepreneurship has been the driving force of many of the successes of humanity and the change of history will probably continue in the form of entrepreneurship (Shah Hosseini, 2009). Joseph Schumpeter, the father of entrepreneurship in defining entrepreneurship says "The essence of entrepreneurship is in understanding and exploiting opportunities". For him, entrepreneurship is a process in which individuals and organizations pursue the opportunities they see, regardless of the resources they currently have, in order to benefit from the goods and services that will be created in the future. (Axelsson et al. 2015). On the other hand, some researchers define entrepreneurship as a personal orientation and move towards future value-adding activities and self-employment in small businesses (Burger and Mahadea, 2005).

Robinson (1991) for the first time presents the theory of attitudes for predicting entrepreneurial activity. Robinson's entrepreneurial attitude model is considered as the basis of the conceptual framework of research due to its coherence and authority in various researches. According to Robinson, this model is the starting point for examining the dimensions of entrepreneurial attitude and does not provide a complete list of components of entrepreneurial attitude. Robinson presented five indicators of recognizing and exploiting opportunity, desire for success, perceived personal control, self-esteem and creativity, and innovation as indicators of entrepreneurship. In this regard, the desire to succeed means to achieve clear results in relation to the goals. Perceived personal control means a person's perception of control and influence over work. Perceived self-esteem is in the sense of one's self-confidence and perception of his/her competencies in dealing with his/her actions. Creativity and innovation mean perception and behavior based on new and unique ways, and finally, recognizing and exploiting opportunities, which is defined in a four-step concept of feeling or understanding needs, recognizing or discovering a fit between needs, and creating a new fit between needs and using opportunities (Hosseini-khah, 2008).

Entrepreneurship first came to the attention of economists in 1934, and all schools of economics since the sixteenth century have somehow described entrepreneurship in their theories. By presenting his theory of economic development in 1934, which coincided with the Great Depression, Joseph Schumpeter raised his views on the pivotal role of entrepreneurs in making a profit, which is why he has been called the "father of entrepreneurship" (Toghraei et al., 2019). After that, most public and private organizations put entrepreneurial approaches and attitudes at the forefront of their organization's development and excellence. What is important in education systems today is that the education system must strive to create and nurture the entrepreneurial spirit in its members. In fact, the inevitable link between the educational system and the economic system has imposed the mission of entrepreneurship on it (Sadeghi Shahmirzadi and Adli, 2010).

Entrepreneurship plays an effective role in the growth and development of the country by creating employment, proportional distribution of incomes, reducing social anxiety, exploiting benefits and activating them, improving the quality of life, discovering needs, inventing and developing new goods and services (Emami, 2008). There is a lot of evidence that entrepreneurship education is effective in increasing the entrepreneurial attitude of individuals and thus increasing the likelihood of entrepreneurship. In fact, the entrepreneurial process is realized by those who have a tendency to success, hard work, perseverance, risk-taking and the ability to foresight (Emerson, 1992).

Regarding the importance of entrepreneurship in educational systems, the study of Shannon et al. (2014) showed that entrepreneurial culture and expectations affect entrepreneurial attitudes, and students are stronger in business innovation and control over business. Tom's research results (2012) showed that entrepreneurship education is effective in increasing entrepreneurial attitude. In Iran, the study of Toghraei et al. (2019) showed that value creation-based education is a central category of entrepreneurial education, which is influenced by the factors that cause the entrepreneurial attitude of teachers, officials and decision-makers in the field of parents and school education. Also, Vahedi et al. (2016) believe that in strengthening entrepreneurial attitudes, it is necessary to pay attention to teaching entrepreneurial concepts, characteristics of successful entrepreneurs, benefits and risks of entrepreneurship, training on starting a business and teaching to write a business plan to the students. Entrepreneurship education at younger ages has a greater impact than older ages. The achievements of entrepreneurship education include problem-solving power, decision-making power, critical thinking, participation in teamwork, effective human relations, correct use of time, introduction of creative and new products, correct use of resources, etc. (Valliere, 2015). In order to achieve these achievements, entrepreneurship education should be seriously considered in schools along with other subjects and should be included in the elementary school curriculum (Guyen, 2009).

What is necessary for the researcher is that due to the need of today's society for entrepreneurship to solve problems such as unemployment and encouraging students to new and needed jobs, The content of elementary school textbooks is expected to address the issue of entrepreneurship and student entrepreneurship indicators more than ever, and provide their educational and career guidance in the future by increasing their attitude and knowledge about entrepreneurship. Elementary education courses with education not only basic skills, but also skills such as problem solving, critical thinking, fostering creativity and innovation in students, can prepare them to face the changing world. Therefore, it is important to pay attention to the content analysis of elementary school textbooks. On the other hand, students need more attention because they play a key role in shaping and developing society and the future of the country. Therefore, officials can take effective steps by using entrepreneurship development to more accurately identify the needs and requirements of this segment of society.

It seems that determining the appropriate system of education in the field of entrepreneurship for the present and the future by those involved is a necessity; In addition, another important point is to recognize the issue of how to use the appropriate system in educating students to develop entrepreneurship, to increase their

entrepreneurial motivation and creativity? Solving this problem is not only very important for any developing society, but also very urgent. The student entrepreneurship system of the country is a national issue. Another requirement of this research is that educational planners, curriculum planners, educational technologists, educational administrators, primary school teachers, other educational levels and knowledge-based entrepreneurial institutions can use its results for more accurate design and editing of books in the future. Therefore, its design and implementation using technology that has many capabilities, is also considered and emphasized as a national issue. As a result, the inclusion and attention to the dimensions and indicators of entrepreneurship in elementary school textbooks can play a significant role in the growth and interest of students in entrepreneurship. Paying attention to the above issues justifies the necessity and importance of the present study, the results of which can be used by educational administrators, educational planners, curriculum planners, teachers and those interested in education. Given the importance of identifying challenges and effective indicators in entrepreneurial attitudes, this study seeks to answer the following questions:

- 1- What are the challenges in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school textbooks?
- 2- What are the effective indicators in the development of entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school?

## Methods

This study is applied in terms of purpose, and based on how the data were collected; the research method was qualitative based on a semi-structured interview. The statistical population included all university professors and entrepreneurship experts. In this study, the selection of interviewees using purposive sampling method was theoretical sampling. The number of these people continued until they reached theoretical saturation and finally in the eleventh interview due to the duplication of the text of the interviews and the consensus on similar indicators, the validity of the obtained information was confirmed. To validate the findings, the researcher used the internal agreement method. The researcher asked two experts in the field of qualitative research who were fully acquainted with the data theory of the foundation to participate in this research as a research partner and to re-perform the process of extracting concepts and open codes. The researcher provided the first coding to the first collaborating researcher and the third coding to the second collaborating researcher. The results obtained from the coding and the result of the internal agreement The internal agreement in the first coding was calculated as 86% and in the second coding as 83%, which considering the acceptable limit above 60% for the validity of the findings, it can be concluded It is acceptable. Finally, the research results were analyzed using interview analysis.

## Results

*Table 1.* Demographic characteristics of the interviewees

Row	Age	Degree of Education	Record Service	of	Post
1	46	PhD in Entrepreneurship	23		Instructor at Azad University
2	45	PhD in Curriculum Planning	25		Associate Professor at Payame Noor University
3	42	PhD in Academic Counseling	20		Associate Professor
4	42	PhD in Curriculum Planning	20		Lecturer
5	40	Master of Entrepreneurship	16		Entrepreneur
6	45	Master of Persian Literature	25		School Principal
7	42	PhD in Educational Management	21		University Associate Professor and School Principal
8	42	PhD in Curriculum Planning	17		Expert in charge of training
9	39	Master of Educational Technology	20		Educational technology expert
10	46	PhD in IT	6		Lecturer
11	51	Master of Management	23		Entrepreneur

The table of demographic characteristics shows that the age of the interviewees is between 38 and 46 years old and their degree is master's and doctorate in various fields of humanities and technology. Most professors, managers and entrepreneurs have more than 15 years of executive records.

The results of the interviews were analyzed using three-step coding method and data analysis was performed in three coding steps. In this study, the researcher began open coding by reading the interviews on paper several times to gain a general understanding of the interviews. Then the different parts of each interview were continued by analyzing each word, phrase, sentence and paragraph. In total, about 213 original codes were extracted from the interviews, which the researcher removed 37 phrases and 176 original codes were extracted during the review. In this stage the researcher after identifying the

concept labels, in the coding stage, by combining and summarizing the initial codes, we reached 99 sub-categories (partial and general).

Selective coding completes the two previous coding steps by integrating and refining the categories into a theoretical framework. In integration, categories are organized around a central or pivotal phenomenon. The central phenomenon is the category that is the main body of the theoretical framework. Other major categories, which can be referred to as sub-categories of the central phenomenon, were related to the central phenomenon using explanatory sentences and expressions. 9 challenges and 7 indicators or effective factors in entrepreneurship were obtained as the main components, and the main research questionnaire was designed.

### **Question 1: What are the challenges in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school textbooks?**

Table 2. Challenges in the field of developing entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of Persian and science textbooks

Row	Indicator
1	Ignoring entrepreneurship
2	Theorization of concepts
3	Lack of entrepreneurship training
4	Making activities optional
5	Lack of space and educational platform
6	Lack of support from officials
7	Lack of evaluation
8	Lack of teachers' skills

From the general point of view and based on the views of most of the interviewees, the above factors have been extracted as the most important challenges in the field of developing entrepreneurial attitude in the content of the textbooks of the first to third grade of elementary school:

According to the results of most interviews, the negligence of students, teachers and school principals and the lack of awareness about the importance of entrepreneurship in students' attitudes in the form of textbooks is a major challenge. Lack of teaching the content of these courses based on entrepreneurial approaches and attitudes is another challenge. Also, the lack of space and facilities in the form of workshops and laboratories to implement entrepreneurial concepts is another challenge. On the other hand, the interviewees consider the lack of support from high-ranking officials for the development of entrepreneurial attitudes in students and its inclusion in the content of textbooks and the existence of a centralized educational system as other challenges in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in textbook content. In fact, centralized and uniform curriculum

planning for all over the country is a challenge due to the different personality traits and entrepreneurial abilities of each region. According to some interviewees, optional classroom activities and handing them over to students as an extracurricular activity lead to lack of evaluation, which leads to the lack of entrepreneurial spirit and attention to it in students. On the other hand, the lack of education for students and the lack of optimal attention of textbook planners in Ministry of Education to entrepreneurship are other challenges.

Many interviewees believe that theorizing has taken the place of operational content. Lessons are more subjective and abstract, and students memorize most lessons, with less emphasis on problem solving and creative thinking at the elementary level. Most of the books do not have practical capabilities and professional skills and there is no training in this regard. Lack of combination of theoretical and practical topics together has caused the practical aspect of entrepreneurship issues in the content of textbooks to be forgotten. Curriculum resources are not designed to create an entrepreneurial spirit and innovation among students, and entrepreneurship courses are not effective in creating entrepreneurial skills and spirit. Entrepreneurship is taught partially and independently, rather than institutionally, in a variety of books.

According to some of the interviewees, not mentioning successful entrepreneurial models, examining the characteristics of entrepreneurs, factors affecting the success of entrepreneurs such as talent, creativity and innovation, and self-confidence in the content of the textbook that is a prerequisite for success at work are other challenges in the content of elementary school textbooks. Also, in the opinion of some of the interviewees, indifference and lack of interest in most teachers to teach topics related to entrepreneurship in the content of books, lack of databases in the form of text, images and questions and activities related to entrepreneurship in the content of textbooks, lack of topics related to entrepreneurial spirit such as innovation, creativity, intelligence, talent, learning skills, introduction of jobs and professions, entrepreneurial tools in the content of textbooks are other challenges. Finally, according to the concepts extracted from the results of the interviews, which included 46 concepts or items, 8 challenges in the content of science and Persian textbooks for first to third grades of elementary school were identified.

### **Question 2: What are the effective indicators in the development of entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school textbooks?**

**Table 3.** Effective indicators in the field of developing entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of Persian and science textbooks

Indicator	
Self-efficacy	1
Participation and interaction	2
Talent identification	3



Operationalization and skills acquisition	4
Laying the groundwork and creating opportunities	5
Desire and confidence in success	6
Flexibility of officials	7

From a general point of view and based on the views of most of the interviewees, the above factors have been extracted as the most important indicators of the development of entrepreneurial attitude in the content of the textbooks of the first to third grades of elementary school:

According to the results of most interviews, the development of entrepreneurial attitudes in Persian and science textbooks should lead to the strengthening of group and individual activities in the content of textbooks. Also, attention should be paid to the discussion of creativity, interest and strengthening the work spirit of students in the content of books. Some of the interviewees believe that entrepreneurship education should be done in the form of producing books with entrepreneurship content, job training posters, educational videos, holding workshops and laboratories in the school environment in order to link science and practice. Also, the factors of desire for success, increasing self-confidence, self-esteem, creativity, intelligence, innovation, talent search and self-efficacy in the content of textbooks should be considered.

According to some interviewees, in order to develop an entrepreneurial attitude, the use of facilities and opportunities in various forms and in the form of text, stories, pictures and questions should be included in the content of textbooks. On the other hand, the focus of books on the discussion of skills, activities including working and learning professions and techniques, mandatory and operational entrepreneurship training in the content of textbooks can be effective and useful in students' positive attitudes towards entrepreneurship. Also, allocating sufficient budget and cost to set up and establish entrepreneurship workshops based on the content in the textbooks is effective in students' gaining skills and creativity. Some of the interviewees believe that the three indicators of attitude, activity and enthusiasm in developing entrepreneurial concepts in the content of the textbook should be highlighted and there should be a significant relationship between the content of elementary school textbooks and the process of development and entrepreneurship and attention to work procedure and production.

Some of the interviewees believe that in order to achieve a profound and radical change in theoretical concepts, skills, trends and processes, functions and new entrepreneurial approaches in the content of books, extensive changes should be made in writing the document of fundamental change in education, and in this regard, different curricula should be designed for entrepreneurship education in primary schools, and their content should be selected based on the diversity of different regions. Entrepreneurship should be included in general educational programs so that students can develop entrepreneurial spirit and skills before reaching higher levels. Institutionalizing



entrepreneurship in the elementary educational system and creating more access to entrepreneurship education is the first step towards creating a culture of innovation and building a new wave of entrepreneur students. Some of the interviewees in the field of entrepreneurial attitude development indicators point to the role of textbook authors, children entrepreneurship education specialists who can take action in compiling entrepreneurship-related content and changing perspectives in this field. The content of the textbooks should also mention the role of creative, professional, entrepreneurial, responsible, prospective, active and innovative human resources, and even schools, in addition to theoretical education, should teach students social capabilities, communicational skills and creative approaches by holding various classes and workshops in order to develop entrepreneurial attitudes.

Two of the interviewees who were entrepreneurs believe that in the content of textbooks the approach of using human resources should be enriched and active methods such as making a business plan, internship, introducing successful entrepreneurs and the characteristics of successful entrepreneurs should be included. Also, interactive methods in solving problems related to entrepreneurship, supervisory, incentive and analytical activities should be used. Then, they considered strategies such as planning to hold theoretical and practical classes together, strengthening the culture of participation and participatory management of teachers and students in the content of textbooks, developing a school-centered entrepreneurship plan, and decentralizing entrepreneurship education in textbooks as the most important indicators of the development of entrepreneurial attitude in the content of textbooks. From the point of view of some of the interviewees, fundamental changes in the textbooks of elementary school, an operational view of the issues raised in the textbooks, creating the necessary space and ground to use the students' talents, and creating and adjusting a futuristic view about entrepreneurship are the most important indicators of developing an entrepreneurial attitude in the course content. Awareness of jobs and professions, innovation and entrepreneurship should also be used in the content of books. Finally, according to the concepts extracted from the results of the interviews, which included 43 concepts or items, 7 effective indicators in the content of science and Persian textbooks for the first to third grades of elementary school were identified

## Conclusion

Question 1: What are the effective indicators in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school?

The results of the interviews were analyzed in primary and secondary coding and extraction of concepts and indicators using content analysis. Finally, the challenges affecting entrepreneurship in Persian and science textbooks of elementary school were identified. In this regard, the components of neglecting entrepreneurship, theorizing concepts, lack of entrepreneurship education, optional activities, lack of educational context and space, lack of support from officials, lack of evaluation and lack of teachers'

skills were introduced as the most important challenges in the field of developing entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of Persian and science textbooks of elementary school. No results found consistent or inconsistent with the results of this question.

Explaining this question based on the results of the interviews, it should be said that unfortunately entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of textbooks are at a low level and schools pay very little attention to the issue of entrepreneurship in schools. Textbooks are more interwoven with theorizing, and the spirit of operationalizing and applying subject matters has been forgotten. The negligence of students, teachers and school principals and the lack of awareness about the importance of entrepreneurship in students' attitudes in the form of textbooks is a major challenge. Also, the lack of space and facilities in the form of workshops and laboratories to implement entrepreneurial concepts is another challenge. Making classroom activities optional and handing them over to students as an extracurricular activity leads to a lack of evaluation which leads to a lack of entrepreneurial spirit and attention to it among students. On the other hand, the lack of education for students and the lack of optimal attention of textbook planners in Ministry of Education to entrepreneurship are other challenges. It is noteworthy that the operational nature of the curriculum has been replaced with theorizing. Lessons are more subjective and abstract, with less emphasis on problem solving and creative thinking. Also, the lack of integration of theoretical and practical topics together has caused the practical aspect of entrepreneurship issues in the content of textbooks to be forgotten. It should be said that education for work requires the acceptance, development and formulation of philosophical principles in order to be able to guide or create it and make changes in working conditions. Job training agents need to establish philosophies that address both technical and professional needs as well as personal growth to meet the working conditions and needs of today and the future. One of the purposes of establishing schools is to nurture entrepreneurial graduates. Entrepreneurship is a process, not a goal, and it is not only in business, but also a way of life that is manifested in all aspects of individual-social life and etc. In the non-entrepreneurial educational system, there will be no opportunity for the emergence and flourishing of children's talent and creativity, and to develop talent and creativity, most of all, management structures and methods are needed that are able to recognize and guide the actual and potential talents of students. Undoubtedly, Ministry of Education should strive to include topics that lead students to entrepreneurship and a positive attitude and interest in the discussion of work and entrepreneurship.

Undoubtedly, having enough space and educational facilities for elementary students to be able to enter the field of work has a great impact on creating a positive attitude towards entrepreneurship. When elementary students enter schools, the school environment plays an important role in shaping their future personality. In this regard, when students see that they can use the tools available in school, surely, they will eagerly seek practical learning of entrepreneurship-based courses. Undoubtedly, increasing the facilities and resources available to teachers and students, attractive and creative physical space of the school, introduction and use of different curricula, private sector support for schools, having a library equipped with new business books are the main factors influencing the promotion of entrepreneurial culture in schools. People with this view

believe that the main factor promoting entrepreneurial culture in schools is improving school resources and facilities. France (2005) also states that many factors are involved in the development of entrepreneurial personality traits that the school has an undeniable role in providing these factors, and school facilities and technology are the factors that are a priority.

On the other hand, task-oriented evaluation, creating growth centers in schools, school interaction with social and economic environments and production and service centers, holding competitions in schools (weekend business competitions), holding student markets in schools, creating thinking rooms in schools and supporting intellectual property in schools are the main factors influencing the development of entrepreneurial attitude in schools. Sadler (2001) also stated that it is not educational organizations that move towards entrepreneurship, but the infrastructure formed in them, their values and operating systems that can play a key role in the entrepreneurship of the organization. Finally, it can be said that paying attention to providing educational facilities and space and paying attention to the entrepreneurial spirit in the content of textbooks should be a priority in the goals of education in primary schools.

Question 2: What are the effective indicators in the development of entrepreneurial attitudes in elementary school textbooks?

The results of the interviews in primary and secondary coding and extraction of concepts and indicators were analyzed using content analysis. The components of self-efficacy, participation and interaction, talent identification, operationalization and acquisition of skills, grounding and creating opportunities, desire and confidence in success and flexibility of officials were identified as the most important effective indicators in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in Persian and science textbook content. No consistent or inconsistent results were found with the results of this question.

In explaining this question based on the results obtained from the interviews, it should be said that paying attention to personality and psychological characteristics, and students' abilities is the most important platform for creating motivation and a positive attitude towards entrepreneurship in elementary students. The Minister of Education, in parallel with its specialized tasks, should include the teaching of life skills to students in the content of textbooks in line with its work. One of the important issues that should be seriously considered is the issue of entrepreneurship, so that from childhood, career and business prospects should be created in the minds of learners, because childhood dreams usually come true. Creating entrepreneurial spirit and attitude is one of the tasks that should be addressed. In cultivating entrepreneurial spirit, what should be considered during training is independence, self-belief, self-confidence, risk-taking and creativity. The development of entrepreneurial attitudes in Persian and science books should lead to the strengthening of group and individual activities in the content of textbooks. Also, attention should be paid to the discussion of creativity, interest and strengthening the work spirit of students in the content of books. Entrepreneurship education should be done in the form of producing books with entrepreneurship content, job training posters, educational videos, holding workshops and laboratories in the school environment in order to link science and practice. Also, the factors of desire for success, increasing self-confidence, self-esteem, creativity, intelligence, innovation, talent search and self-

efficacy should be considered in the content of textbooks. The three indicators of attitude, activity and enthusiasm in developing entrepreneurial concepts in the content of the textbook should be highlighted and a significant relationship should be established between the content of elementary school textbooks and the process of development and entrepreneurship and attention to work and production procedures.

Entrepreneurship should be included in general education programs so that students can develop entrepreneurial spirit and skills before reaching higher levels. Institutionalizing entrepreneurship in the primary educational system and creating more access to entrepreneurship education is the first step towards creating a culture of innovation and building a new wave of entrepreneur students. The content of books should also mention the role of creative, professional, entrepreneurial, responsible, futuristic, active and innovative human resources, and even schools, in addition to theoretical education, should teach students social capabilities, communicational skills and creative approaches by holding various classes and workshops in order to develop entrepreneurial attitudes. Finally, it should be said that strategies such as planning to hold theoretical and practical classes together, strengthening the culture of participation and participatory management of teachers and students in the content of textbooks, developing a school-centered entrepreneurship plan, and decentralizing entrepreneurship education in textbooks are the most important indicators of the development of entrepreneurial attitude in the content of textbooks.

Familiarity of students with organizations and institutions such as exchange and employment offices, and the use of entrepreneurship documentaries, exhibitions, festivals and magazines in schools, provide workshops for students' parents to institutionalize entrepreneurial beliefs, inform students about out-of-school job opportunities, holding meetings of top entrepreneurs with students, familiarizing students with the problems of their city's labor market, identifying entrepreneurial opportunities in schools, using cyberspace and providing suggestions from teachers and school staff to promote entrepreneurship are the main factors in entrepreneurship development. Anderson and Wiseman (2014) also discuss the role of mass media and information and communication technology in innovation and entrepreneurship education in adolescents. Also, the emphasis of educational content on self-confidence, creativity and innovation, e-learning and web-based learning, providing a creative and pragmatic curriculum, utilizing up-to-date educational technology, brainstorming education, continuous modification and renewal of educational content, adaptation of educational content to the needs of students, emphasis on students' problem-solving ability in the teaching process are another factors in developing an entrepreneurial attitude in the content of textbooks. Criticizing traditional education, Torrance (2010) emphasizes the importance of transforming traditional programs and directing education toward creative programs. This researcher believes that in order to realize this issue, it is necessary to enrich the educational environment and provide a creative program, so the training of creative teachers is very important in order to train creative students. Shoughi et al. (2016) in their research concluded that due to the development of Internet-based educational systems, it is possible to provide educational contents and courses that can be used to create entrepreneurship courses by increasing students' knowledge. Finally, it should be noted

that paying attention to the mentioned indicators can be effective in developing entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of elementary textbooks.

Regarding the limitations of the research and considering that the statistical population of the present study is limited to elementary school textbooks and teachers in Takab city in the academic year of 2020-2021, so its generalization to other grades and teachers of other provinces and cities should be done with caution. Also, the lack of benefit from students' opinions was another limitation of this study; since students are one of the main beneficiaries of schools, presumably, their views could have generated other views and inferences. In the field of practical suggestions, due to the low level of adaptation and relationship between the content of elementary school textbooks and entrepreneurship indicators, it is suggested that high-ranking officials and authors of elementary school textbooks try to change the content of textbooks and develop entrepreneurial attitudes according to the needs of the country market. Also, according to the research results on the challenges and indicators in the field of entrepreneurial attitudes in the content of textbooks, it is suggested that high-ranking officials in the field of education take action to create positive attitude and interest in students towards entrepreneurship by creating the needed laboratory environment, and teachers and principals explore students' creativity, ability, and talent, and value students in order to create a positive attitude towards entrepreneurship. Finally, regarding the future suggestions and considering that this research has been done among teachers and university professors, so it is suggested that in other researches, the statistical population of students should be used to evaluate their attitudes about entrepreneurship in schools.

### Disclosure Statements

This dissertation is taken from a doctoral dissertation and the authors are committed to abide by the rules of the journal.

### ORCID

**Chamran Ghanbari:** <https://www.orcid.org/000-0002-4181-9544>

### References

- Altbach, P.G., Kelly, G.P., Petrie, H.G., & Weis, L. (eds.) (1991). Textbooks in American Education. Albany:State University of New York Press. Albany.
- Axelsson, K., Hägglund, S. and Sandberg, A. (2015). Entrepreneurial Learning in Education Preschool as a Take-Off for the Entrepreneurial Self, *Journal of Education and Training*, 2(2), 40- 58.
- Burger, L., O'Neill, C., Mahadea, D. (2005). The impact of previous knowledge and experience on the entrepreneurial attitudes of Grade 12 learners. *South African Journal of Education*, 25, 89-94.

- Emami, M R, Saeedi, M (1387). Dimensions and strategies for cultivating and developing the culture of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship in the country. *Monthly Labor and Society*, 99 and 98, 54 - 61. (Persian)
- Emerson, B, Stuart, B (1992). Psychological Traits of Rural Entrepreneurs. *The Journal of Socio-Economics*, 21, 353-362.
- France, T. N. & O’Cinneide, B. (2005). Entrepreneurship Education and Training Programmes: A Review and Evaluation – Part 1. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 18 (8), 3-12.
- Garavan, T. N. & O’Cinneide, B. (۲۰۰۶). Entrepreneurship Education and Training Programmes: A Review and Evaluation – Part ۱. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, ۱۸(۸), ۳-۱۲
- Guyen, semra (2009). New primary education course programmes and entrepreneurship, *procedial*, 1, 263-270.
- Hosseini Khawa, A (1387). "Possibility and Necessity of Entrepreneurship Education in Schools", *Curriculum Quarterly*, No. 11, pp. 94-66 (Persian)
- Jafari M, S; Arezoo, S F (2015) A Study of the Development of Entrepreneurial Attitude in Textbooks (Case Study: Persian Textbooks for Primary School), *Social, Economic, Scientific and Cultural Quarterly of Work and Society*, No. 135, pp. 45-32. (Persian)
- Jahanian, R (1389). "Study of Entrepreneurship Development Strategies in Technical and Vocational Schools of Islamic Azad University", *Scientific-Research Quarterly of Educational Management Research*, 51- No. 2, p.74 (Persian)
- Lindsay, Wendy, Lindsay, Noel, Jordaan, Anton (2007). Investigating the Values-Entrepreneurial Attitude-Opportunity Recognition Relationship in Nascent Entrepreneurs. *Regional Frontiers of Entrepreneurship Research*, 562-568.
- Lumbantobing, Riris (2005). Comparative Study on Process Skills in the Elementary Science Curriculum and Textbooks between Indonesia and Japan. *Bulletin of the Graduate School of Education, Hiroshima University*. Part. II, Arts and science education, 53, 31-38
- Nasari, M; Ghomashchi c; and Feizi, K 2016, Review of the content of sixth grade textbooks in elementary school in paying attention to and creating entrepreneurship and creativity in students, *First International Conference on Entrepreneurship, Creativity and Innovation*, Shiraz, Kharazmi Higher Institute of Science and Technology (Persian)



- Razzino, Marianne Pauline (2003). Environmental Education in Mexico: A Content Analysis of Primary School Textbooks. Unpublished master's thesis, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Virginia
- Reza S, A; Masoom Nejad, Z (2015). Entrepreneurship, Knowledge and Technology Publications, first edition (Persian)
- Robinson, Peter B., Stimpson, David V., Huefner, Jonathan C., Hunt, H. Keith (1991). An Attitude Approach to the Prediction of Entrepreneurship. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*. 50, 13-31.
- Sadeghi Sh, Adly S, Fariba D (2007). "The Relationship between the Higher Education System and the Development of Students' Entrepreneurial Spirit", *Educational Research Journal of Islamic Azad University, Bojnour Branch*, No. 22, pp. 90-73
- Sadler, R. (2001). A framework for the emergence of entrepreneurship and innovation in education, conference paper for the Centre for the Economics of Education and Training, Retrieved June 20, 2009.
- Sarukhani, B (۱۳۸۴). *Research Methods in Social Sciences*, Volume 1, Tehran: Institute of Humanities and Cultural Studies. (Persian)
- Shah Hosseini, A (۱۳۸۸). *Entrepreneurship in action*. Tehran: Ayizh.
- Shanan, Gibson, G., Harris, Michael L., Barber III, Dennis (2009). Comparing the Entrepreneurial Attitudes of Chinese and Brazilian Students. *Southern Journal of Entrepreneurship*, 28, 56-70
- Shariff, M N Mohd, S, Mohammad B (2009). An Attitude Approach to the Prediction of Entrepreneurship on Students at Institution of Higher Learning in Malaysia. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 4, 129-135.
- Shoghi, B. & Shafighi, F. (201۶). Entrepreneurship E-Learning and e-Entrepreneurship. The first National Education conference in Iran 2025. Retrieved from: [http://www.civilica.com/Paper-INCE01-INCE01\\_127.htm](http://www.civilica.com/Paper-INCE01-INCE01_127.htm) (In Persian)
- Tam, H W (2009). How and to What Extent Does Entrepreneurship Education Make Students More Entrepreneurial? A California Case of the Technology Management program. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of California, Santa Barbara.
- Timmons, J., Spinelli, S. (2007). *New Venture Creation: Entrepreneurship for the 21st Century*, Irwin McGraw-Hill, Boston, 7th Edition



- Toghraei, M T; Mir Ahadi,S S; Hashemi,S(1398). Designing an Entrepreneurial Education Model in School, Quarterly Journal of Educational Innovations, 71 (18): pp. 58-59(Persian)
- Torrance, E. P. (2010). Fostering Academic creativity in gifted students Eic Digest, USA.
- Vahedi, M, Seif Naraghi, M; Naderi E (۲۰۱۵). Entrepreneurship education in work and technology books in Iran in the sixth, seventh and eighth grades based on the pattern of your future entrepreneurship education in the banner of entrepreneurship, new educational ideas, 12 (3): 141-128(Persian)
- Vaseghi, B (۲۰۱۰). "Content Analysis of Entrepreneurship Textbook and the Opinion of Entrepreneurship Teachers in Ardabil Province from the Perspective of Entrepreneurship Characteristics", M.Sc. Thesis, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Kharazmi University, Tehran.
- Williams, R (2001). Alberta Social Studios Textbooks and Human Rights Education. Master's Thesis University of Alberta, Alber

