

The Scope of the Infallibility of Prophets According to the Imamiyah

DOR: 20.1001.1.27174476.2020.1.1.12.0

گستره عصمت انبیاء از دیدگاه امامیه

Received: 17/03/2020

Accepted: 22/08/2020

Ali Parimi¹

Abstract:

One of the controversial issues is the infallibility of the prophets, which has long been a point of contention among Islamic scholars. Hence, each of the Islamic sects has a different opinion on this issue; however, all of them have absolutely accepted the principle of the infallibility of the prophets. Among the Islamic sects that accept the infallibility of the prophets and have a different view from the other is the Shiite Imamiyah. A small number of Imamis do not consider infallibility from error and mistake in ordinary affairs necessary for an infallible person and consider negligence and forgetfulness in these matters permissible; however, according to Imami scholars, the prophets are immune from all minor and major sins from childhood and even before puberty, and they are infallible in all matters. Accordingly, this article, with the aim of "knowing and getting acquainted with the famous opinion of Imami scholars", deals with the scope and realm of the infallibility of the prophets and answers some doubts about this issue in order to clarify it according to the famous imami scholars, which in fact originates from Imams' words, the Shiite Imams accept the infallibility of the prophets and do not accept any negligence or forgetfulness in any of the affairs and stages of their lifetime.

Keywords: Infallibility, Prophets, Imamiyah, Negligence, Forgetfulness.

علی پریمی^۱

چکیده:

یکی از مباحث بحث‌برانگیز، عصمت انبیا می‌باشد که از دیرزمان در بین دانشمندان اسلامی موضع بحث و اختلاف بوده است. از این رو، هر یک از فرقه‌های اسلامی در این باره نظر متفاوت با یکدیگر دارند؛ هرچند همه آنها اصل عصمت انبیا را به‌طور مطلق پذیرفته‌اند. از جمله فرق اسلامی که موضوع عصمت انبیا را پذیرفته و دیدگاهی متفاوت از دیگر فرق دارد، فرقه شیعه امامیه است. تعداد اندکی از طایفه امامیه، عصمت از خطا و اشتباه در امور عادی را برای معصوم لازم نمی‌دانند و سهو و نسیان را در این امور جایز می‌دانند؛ ولی به نظر قاطبه حکمای امامیه، انبیا از زمان کودکی و حتی قبل از بلوغ، از همه گناهان صغیره و کبیره مصون‌اند و از سهو و نسیان در همه امور معصوم می‌باشند. بر این اساس، این مقاله با هدف «شناخت و آشنایی با نظر مشهور علمای امامیه» به گستره و قلمرو عصمت انبیا می‌پردازد و به برخی شبهات پیرامون این موضوع پاسخ می‌دهد تا روشن نماید که طبق نظر مشهور امامیه که برگرفته از سخن ائمه معصومین می‌باشد، شیعه امامیه، عصمت انبیا را پذیرفته و هیچ‌گونه نقص و نسیان را در هیچ یک از امور و مراحل زندگی این بزرگواران نمی‌پذیرد.

کلمات کلیدی: عصمت، انبیاء، امامیه، سهو، نسیان.

¹ Assistant Professor, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran.
ali.parimi@yahoo.com

¹ استادیار گروه علوم قرآن و حدیث، دانشگاه پیام نور، تهران، ایران.
ali.parimi@yahoo.com

Introduction

In the Holy Qur'an, God points to the purpose of man's creation and says: "Deemed ye then that We had created you for naught, and that ye would not be returned unto Us?" (Mu'minūn: 115).¹

Now we can achieve the purpose, which is the perfection and happiness of man, by two things:

1- There should be an inherent and developmental merit in man that leads him to perfection.

2- Divine leaders who have been trained from the divine school. On the other hand, in order for these divine leaders and teachers to be able to lead human beings to that perfection and happiness, they must be endowed with the best attributes and perfections, as well as free from imperfections and flaws. And they should act upon what they say and they must stay away from what they forbid so that people will obey them willingly and accept their promises and make their behavior and manners as their model. This issue is one of the factors that have caused the issue of infallibility of the prophets to be constantly considered by people and scientists throughout history, and Islamic scholars in their books and works always dedicate a part of their discussions to the issue of infallibility of the prophets. Among the monographs and articles on the infallibility of the prophets and the doubts in this field, we can mention the book "Infallibility" written by Sadegh Arzagani and the article "Mulla Sadra's view on the infallibility of the prophets from sin" by Reza Akbari.

This article deals with the Imamiyyah view on the extent of the

infallibility of the prophets; hence, the concept of infallibility is stated and the necessity and types of infallibility are examined, then the extent of infallibility is identified and the views of Islamic thinkers are pointed out, and the view of famous Imamiyyah scholars on the infallibility of the prophets is mentioned and finally, doubts on the verses of the Qur'an about the infallibility of the prophets are examined.

1. The concept of 'Iṣmah

The word "Iṣmah" (i.e. infallibility) with its derivatives has been included in the Qur'an thirteen times. 'Iṣmah is derived from the word "aṣam" (Ibn Fāris, 1418, p.331). The word "aṣam" means protection along with defense and has been used in the Holy Qur'an considering these two conditions (protection and defense). "Allah will protect thee from mankind"² (Mā'idah: 67) and "Say: Who is he who can preserve you from Allah if He intendeth harm for you, or intendeth mercy for you."³ (Ahzāb: 17).

Lexicologists have mentioned two meanings for the word "Iṣmah":

1. Realization of protection and defense of something (infinitive noun).

2. Something that is clang on.

Therefore, the "Ma'ṣūm: infallible" is the one who is defended to be protected from danger or harm (Jawādī Āmulī, 2009, p.248 and the same, 2010, p.184). Paying attention to the literal meaning of the infallible indicates that God makes a servant subject to special grace and care and takes care of him so that whenever the conditions and requirements for committing a sin are provided, he will be blessed with the

١. أَفَحَسِبْتُمْ أَنَّمَا خَلَقْنَاكُمْ عَبَثًا وَأَنَّكُمْ إِلَيْنَا لَا تُرْجَعُونَ.
٢. «وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ».

٣. «قُلْ مَنْ ذَا الَّذِي يَعْصِمُكُمْ مِنَ اللَّهِ إِنْ أَرَادَ بِكُمْ سُوءًا».

success of abstaining and self-restraint. And if he wants to commit it by mistake and inadvertently, He brings him out of the mistake and informs him of the present truth, and the privilege that the infallible has over the other people is that he has the talent and merit of this privilege and special grace of God and others do not. Otherwise, the All-Wise God does not act in vain and does not withhold His general grace from anyone, and stinginess and oppression are not conceivable in His sacred realm. Sheikh Mufid says: "Infallibility from God for prophets and imams is the success and grace with which the infallibles are protected from sins and wrongdoings in the religion of God, and infallibility is a favor from God to the one whom God knows that he clings to His infallibility and accepting infallibility is the act of infallible, and infallibility never prevents the power over sin, nor does it force a person to do good deeds." (Shariati, 1967, p.66).

2. The Necessity of 'Ismah

2-1. Infallibility of error

Divine prophets must necessarily be infallible in receiving "revelation" and communicating it to the people; that is, people should not assume that what this Prophet is narrating to the people as "revelation" and the words of God Almighty may be wrong. The reason for this necessity is clear; because in the absence of this immunity, the philosophy of revelation, which is evolution, will not be realized, because a mistake in communicating "revelation" will definitely lead to

deviation from the path of evolution, and assuming that no mistake actually occurs, the lack of Prophet's immunity from error is enough to remove the trust of people in what he said (this reason can completely deny the error of the Prophet) and therefore, by the decisive rule of reason, God must protect His messengers from error in conveying revelation.

Allameh Tabataba'i considers the following verse as the reason of the infallibility of the Prophets in receiving the revelation and their Risālah:

"Mankind were one community, and Allah sent (unto them) prophets as bearers of good tidings and as warners, and revealed therewith the Scripture with the truth that it might judge between mankind concerning that wherein they differed. And only those unto whom (the Scripture) was given differed concerning it, after clear proofs had come unto them, through hatred one of another."¹

This is because the nature of verse is that God has sent the prophets for warning and good news and bringing the book (which is the revelation) to express the truth to people; truth in belief and in practice and in other words the prophets have been sent to guide people towards the true beliefs and actions, which has been the purpose of god in sending the prophets (Mousavi Hamedani, 1995, p.200).

2-2. Infallibility of sin

In addition to innocence from error, the prophets of God must also be immune from sin, because the prophets of God

١. «فَبَعَثَ اللَّهُ النَّبِيِّينَ مُبَشِّرِينَ وَمُنذِرِينَ، وَاتَّزَلَّ مَعَهُمُ الْكِتَابَ بِالْحَقِّ، لِيُحْكَمَ بَيْنَ النَّاسِ فِي مَا اختلفوا فِيهِ وَ مَا اختلف فِيهِ إِلَّا الَّذِينَ أُوتُوهُ مِنْ بَعْدِ مَا جَاءَتْهُمْ الْبَيِّنَاتُ، نَغياً بَيْنَهُمْ فَهَدَى اللَّهُ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لِمَا اختلفوا فِيهِ مِنَ الْحَقِّ بِإِذْنِهِ».

who strive to save society from pollution and corruption and destruction and ugliness and lead them to the philosophy of creation and evolution, if they are not immune from being drown in pollution, they will not be able to fulfill their mission, and their example is like one who does not know how to swim and has no immunity from drowning, but he wants to save the people! (Mohammadi Reyshahri, 1981, p.205). Allameh in Al-Mizan enumerates a number of verses which indicate the infallibility of the prophets absolutely (Mousavi Hamedani, 1995, p.203). Here we mention only one verse that denies the infallibility of the prophets, and leave the detailed study to those who are interested and researchers. In verse 17 of Surah Al-Kahf, God says: "Whom Alla guides him, he will be guided"¹

This holy verse denies the plunder and misguidance of any misguided persons from the guided ones to their guidance, saying: "There is no misguidance in such people and it is clear that sin is also a kind of misguidance, because of the holy verse: "Did I not charge you, O ye sons of Adam, that ye worship not the devil - Lo! he is your open foe! But that ye worship Me? That was the right path. Yet he hath led astray of you a great multitude. Had ye then no sense?" (Yāsīn: 60-62).²

Who called every sin a misguidance that is committed by the misguidance of the devil, and said, 'Do not worship the devil, for he leads you astray.' Therefore, proving God's guidance in the right of the prophets and then denying the misguidance of anyone who

has been guided by Him, and then calling any sin a misguidance, indicates that the realm of the prophets is free from any sin, they are also free from making a mistake in understanding the revelation and communicating it to the people (Mousavi Hamedani, 1995, p.203).

2-3. Types of Infallibility

In ideological discussions, when the word "infallibility" is used in relation to the prophets or their guardians, it refers to two types of immunity that the chosen leaders of God Almighty enjoy:

A) Immunity from sin.

B) Immunity from error.

Immunity from sin means that: The prophets and Imams not only do not sin, but are immune from contamination with sin, and not only they do not make mistakes but they are also immune to mistakes. In other words, God's chosen leaders have a special spiritual characteristic that makes sin and error impossible for them (Mohammadi Reyshahri, 1981, p.205).

2-4. Extent of Infallibility of Prophets

As it is clear from the lexical discussion of infallibility, its meaning is general and includes the protection and defense of any harm, but in theological discussions it refers to protection against sin and error, which results in the abandonment of sin and mistake (Jawādī Āmulī, 2009, p.249).

On the other hand, infallibility has degrees that can be expressed in four levels:

1- Infallibility in beliefs;

2- Infallibility in the matter of propaganda;

١. «مَنْ يَهْدِ اللَّهُ فَهُوَ الْمُهْتَدِ».

٢. «أَلَمْ أَعْهَدْ إِلَيْكُمْ يَا بَنِي آدَمَ أَنْ لَا تَعْبُدُوا الشَّيْطَانَ؟ إِنَّهُ لَكُمْ عَدُوٌّ مُبِينٌ وَأَنْ اعْبُدُونِي هَذَا صِرَاطٌ مُسْتَقِيمٌ، وَلَقَدْ أَضَلَّ مِنْكُمْ جِبِلًّا كَثِيرًا».

3- Infallibility in expressing rulings;

4- Infallibility in ordinary actions and affairs.

There are different views among Islamic scholars on which of the above degrees is necessary for the prophets, but most of the reasons for denying the infallibility of the prophets are related to the last degree of infallibility, i.e. infallibility in ordinary life, and what is related to non-revelation (<http://intjz.net>, quoted by Ilya Batool, a look at the infallibility of the prophets in the Holy Qur'an).

Therefore, it is clear from the study of theological sources that some consider the prophets to be infallible before and after prophecy, and others consider the prophets to be infallible only after prophecy. Both groups differ in the type of sin denied for the prophets. Some prophets are considered infallible from the major sins, some are considered infallible from the major and minor sins, and some are considered infallible from the major sins, the minor sins, and everything that is ugly, disgusting, and hated in the custom of the people.

In this article, we have decided to express the extent of the infallibility of the prophets from the Imamiyyah point of view. Therefore, before addressing the Imamiyyah approach, we need to consider the view of other Islamic sects in order to clear the position of the difference of the Islamic sects with Imamiyyah.

3. The View of the Islamic Sects on the Scope of the Infallibility of the Prophets

The Mu'tazilite believe that the prophets have immunity from major sins, but they may do minor sins, except for minor sins

that are a sign of the inferiority of the soul and the nature and cause the hatred of individuals; like stealing a piece of bread. Abu Ali Jaba'ī believes that the prophets are intentionally immune from major and major sins, but the issuance of any minor or major sin is unimpeded if it is inadvertently committed.

Some groups, such as Nezam, believe that committing a sin intentionally by the prophets is not permissible, but it is unimpeded if it is inadvertently committed. Of course, prophets will be questioned of unintentional sins, whereas if their followers are inadvertently guilty of sin, they will be pardoned. The reason for the rebuke of the prophets is that they have the power to forsake inadvertent sins due to the transcendence of their souls.

Hashwīyah, who believe in the incarnation of God, consider it permissible to commit any sin, whether intentional or unintentional. In addition to the above differences, Islamic scholars have another difference of opinion regarding the time of infallibility, which is: Many Mu'tazilite believe that the beginning of infallibility is the beginning of puberty and the prophets are not immune from sin before puberty. Some Ash'arites, such as Imam Fakhr Rāzī, believe that the beginning of infallibility is accompanied by Bi'thah, and before the Bi'thah, the issuance of sin by the prophets is unimpeded (Nasri, 1986, p.212).

4. The Scope of the Infallibility of the Prophets from the Perspective of the Imamiyyah

The Imamiyyah School, or the Shiite and Twelver Schools, do not consider

the Imamate and succession of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) to be chosen by individuals or councils in the face of other religions and sects. Rather, the Imamate is considered a divine covenant for Ali ibn Abi Tālib and his 11 children, and therefore, the believers to this opinion can be called Imamiyyah. (Www Pajooh.com)

According to the Ahl al-Bayt (AS), the infallibility of the prophets is one of the definite and certain issues, so they have spoken about it in detail. Here we deal with the famous opinion of Shiite scholars based on the words of Ahl al-Bayt (AS) (Sadeghi Arzagani, 2004, p.18): Ibn Babawayh (RA) says: "Our belief in the dignity of the prophets and messengers (PBUT) is that they are infallible and purified from all filth and that they do not commit any sin, neither major nor minor, they do not disobey the Almighty God, they do whatever they are commanded and whatever they are commissioned to do, and whoever does not consider them infallible while they are innocent, then he is an ignorant; and everyone who is ignorant to their right is infidel, and our believe in their dignity is that from the beginning of their affairs to the end, they are always infallible, complete, perfect, and all-knowing, and they are never characterized by imperfection, sin, or ignorance" (Qomi, 2007, p.136 and Muzaffar, 2003, p.8).

Sheikh Sadūq says: "Our belief about the prophets, angels and leaders of the religion (PBUT) is that they are infallible and pure from any kind of pollution and do not commit any sin, as God has commanded them. They don't make any mistakes" (Sadeghi Arzagani, 2004, p.18).

Sheikh Muḥīd says: "The prophets and imams (AS) are immune from all major and minor sins in Nubuwwah and

Imāmah: that is, from the time when their intellect and wisdom were perfected, before the time of duty until the time of their death, they did not have any flaws or ignorance, and like Jesus and John, they were perfect and infallible in childhood and before puberty, and the intellect never hesitates to accept this" (Ibid and Shariati, 1967, p.62).

Sheikh Tūsī, like the famous scholars of Imamiyyah, believes in the infallibility of the prophets (Sheikh Tūsī, nd, v.1, p.159, 161 and 7, p.217). He says: "It is obligatory for the Prophet to be infallible from all ugliness; whether the sin is minor or major, it is before prophecy or after it, it is by mistake or not, it is unintentionally and forgetfulness or in any way imagined (Ibid, 1983, p.320-321 and Sheikh Tūsī, 1406, p.260).

Sheikh Tūsī does not consider infallibility from error in ordinary affairs necessary for the infallible. According to him, infallibility from error and mistake in this position is not necessary and in these matters, if they do not interfere with the perfection of reason, mistake is permissible (Tūsī, nd, p.165).

The sheikh seems to believe that escaping such mistakes is not permissible. As he says: "How is it that inadvertence and forgetfulness are not permissible for the prophets in ordinary matters while they are sometimes sick, they are sleeping and anesthesia is afflicted on them and sleep is a kind of mistake (forgetfulness) and they also forget things about themselves and their past affairs (Tūsī, nd, p.166). As Seyyed Morteza has considered the mistake of the Prophet in such cases is permissible. (Rahimaf, 2010, p.55)

According to Mullah Sadra, the prophets are immune from infidelity and polytheism. This issue is common among different theological sects and Mulla Sadra is also interested in this matter (Sadr al-Muti'allihīn, 1987, p.112).

Mulla Sadra considers the fulfillment of other major intentional sins before and after the Bi'thah impossible, but he believes that the reasons given for denying the major inadvertent sin are not sufficient (Sadr al- Muti'allihīn, 1987, p.115).

After stating the proofs of infallibility, he states that some of them are insufficient along with the arguments of the opponents (ibid.). According to him, prophets hate minor sins such as stealing a piece of food from an orphan (Akbari and Mansouri, 2010, p.13). Prophets are innocent before and after Bi'thah, but he considers the existing reasons for denying minor non-hateful sins such as the intention to commit a sin insufficient (Akbari and Mansouri, 2010, p.13, 14 and 15).

Shahid Motahhari considered infallibility as a special Shiite theological belief; as he states in this regard: The infallibility of the prophets and imams is one of the characteristics of the Shiites who consider the prophets and imams infallible from sin, both minor sins and major sins (Motahhari, 2011, p.102).

Ayatollah Jawādī Āmulī in examining the infallibility of the prophets, has given different degrees to the prophets; therefore, he says in this regard: "The queen of Iṣmah has some degrees, just as Nubuwwat, Imamate,

Risālat, and caliphate have different degrees; as the Qur'an says: "Of those messengers, some of whom We have caused to excel others" (Baqarah: 253)¹ and "And we preferred some of the prophets above others" ('Isrā': 55)²

So, just as Nubuwwat and Risālat have levels, so do the degrees of infallibility of the prophets; although they are all innocent. The prophets of "Ulu l-'Azm" are in a higher degree of infallibility. The rank of the superior prophet causes the one who is in a lower rank to consider himself a sinner in comparison with the higher prophet; without committing a major or minor sin: «حسنات الأبرار سيئات المقربين»

This means a prophet who considers himself in a position that is incomplete compared to the rank of the prophets of Ulu l-'Azm, he compares himself to the more perfect prophets. Hence, he cries and murmurs and says: "So, give mercy to Your ignorant servant" (Iftitāh Prayer).³

Although he is a great and innocent human being. When ordinary people say the above sentence in the prayers, they do not really know many things and are ignorant of the "common thought", but when this is the prayer of the great prophet and the perfect and prominent figure of the human world, who has reached to the position of: "...and teacheth thee that which thou knewest not..." (Nisā': 113).⁴

So it becomes clear that he sees himself in the presence of the holy essence of God and in front of Him, therefor he shows himself to be ignorant, sinful, etc. Because any defect

١. «تلك الرسل فضلنا بعضهم على بعض...».

٢. «ولقد فضلنا بعض النبيين على بعض».

٣. «فارحم عبدك الجاهل».

٤. «... علمك ما لم تكن تعلم...».

from this point of view is considered a sin" (Jawādī Āmulī, 2005, p.207).

He also says in other places: "Infallibility" is one of the outstanding scientific and practical perfections of the divine prophets. "Infallibility" is not only the practical queen, because it is not justice so it does not protect man only from intentional and inadvertent sin, but also protects man from ignorance, error, mistake, forgetfulness and fallacy in thought and thinking; therefore, the infallible is safe from misunderstanding in the field of science and from wrongdoing in the field of action. Infallibility is an extraordinary intuition that keeps man from sin. Although the principle of intuition belongs to theoretical reason and abstinence from sin belongs to practical reason; but the source of the infallibility of practical reason is the same as theoretical reason; the lower one goes, the more the intellect of reason goes far from the intellect of action; sometimes one is and the other is not, or one is weak and the other is strong.

The higher one goes and the closer one gets to pure intuition, the closer these two factions become to each other to the point where they become united; like the great angels whose knowledge is the same as action and above them is God Almighty whose knowledge is the same as action and as it is safe in knowledge: "...And not an atom's weight in the earth or in the sky escapeth your Lord,..." (Yūnus: 61)¹ and he is infallible from ignorance, mistake, forgetfulness, etc.: "...and thy Lord was never forgetful" (Maryam: 64).²

In practical matters, he is safe from any ugliness and oppression: "And they

find all that they did confronting them, and thy Lord wrongeth no-one" (Kahf: 49).³

Because at that stage, science is the same as power and power is the same as science; although in terms of word and meaning, the two are separate from each other. Because the prophets are truthful in knowledge and practice, their infallibility will also be in two positions: scientific infallibility and practical infallibility.

5. Scientific Infallibility

Scientific infallibility is the highest degree of piety, although the part of scientific infallibility may also be called scientific piety; but piety and self-control are the voluntary act of man and one of the issues of practical intellect in which the carnal will, which is the distance between the action and the soul, is involved; but science becomes necessary as preliminaries are obtained.

The prophets are all infallible in scientific matters; that is, what is related to the guidance of human beings is fully received from God, they understand it, and what they understand, they keep well and do what they keep right. This scientific queen is not possible without intuition, because in the intoxication of illusion and imagination, man presents his weaves to the findings of reason and makes it confusing, and this confusing thinking will be mixed with ignorance, mistake and forgetfulness; but if he stays in the sanctuary of pure intellect and escapes from delusion, he will be infallible.

For in the sanctuary of reason, neither the inner demon exists nor the outer demon, for the abstractness of Iblis - like

¹. «وَمَا يَعْزُبُ عَنْ رَبِّكَ مِنْ مِثْقَالِ ذَرَّةٍ فِي الْأَرْضِ وَلَا فِي السَّمَاءِ وَ...»
². «وَمَا كَانَ رَبُّكَ نَسِيًّا».

³. «وَلَا يَظْلِمُ رَبُّكَ أَحَدًا».

illusion – is in a ceiling below the ceiling of pure reason, and in the system of total intellectual abstract, there is neither illusion as an inner robber; nor Iblis, who is the outer robber, because He said: “He said: Now, because Thou hast sent me astray, verily I shall lurk in ambush for them on Thy Right Path.” ('A'rāf: 16)¹

But if a person is on the straight path, he is safe from the harm of temptation and intrigue, as God Almighty said to His Messenger: “Lo! thou art of those sent. On a straight path.” (Yāsīn: 3-4).²

The path is the same as the passerby and the passerby is the same as path, not that the path is a place and has a passerby. In matters of belief, the path is the same as passerby. Satan has lurked at the beginning of the path, not in the middle or its higher stages, so those who attained the position of sincerity through most of the straight path are safe from the harm of his temptation: “Save Thy single-minded slaves among them” (Sād: 83).³

Therefore, a person who has attained the status of scientific and intuitive sincerity is ostensibly and permanently immune in scientific matters; He does not misunderstand anything and does not doubt or misunderstand what he understands. Because the one who understands the single abstract soul is sincere and his teacher is a God who is pure knowledge: “He said: I am only a messenger of thy Lord, that I may bestow on thee a faultless son,” (Maryam: 19)⁴ and “And not an atom's

weight in the earth or in the sky escapeth your Lord.” (Yūnus: 61)⁵

Hence, Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS) says: “From the time I was presented with the right, I did not doubt and became the embodiment of "no doubt in it" (Nahj al-Balāghah, Wisdom 184).

6. Practical Infallibility

The position of practical infallibility is achieved for one who has reached the boundary of sincerity. At the same time, false lust and anger have no way in he, because he has controlled both of them, turned them into will and hatred, then he has diluted his will and hatred and turned it into Tawallī and Tabarrī. The perfect human being has gone through the stages of attraction and repulsion, lust and anger, love and enmity, will and hatred, to the position of Tawallī and Tabarrī, which is the thinnest stage of will and hatred, the gentlest stage of love and enmity, the smoothest stage of lust and attraction and repulsion. He who has attained the position of Tawallī and Tabarrī, considers the devil as the most hostile enemy inside and outside, and suppresses him, overcomes all enemies, and becomes the custodian of the truth, just as the truth is his guardian.

The Messenger of God, who is under the guardianship of God, says: “Lo! my Protecting Friend is Allah Who revealeth the Scripture. He befriendeth the righteous” ('A'rāf: 196).⁶

As the earth is the heritage of the one whose essence is pious and he never thinks badly, nor does he follow a bad path, not those whose work is only

١. «لَأَقْعُدَنَّ لَهُمْ صِرَاطَكَ الْمُسْتَقِيمَ».

٢. «إِنَّكَ لَمِنَ الْمُرْسَلِينَ عَلَى صِرَاطٍ مُسْتَقِيمٍ».

٣. «إِلَّا عِبَادَكَ مِنْهُمْ الْمُخْلِصِينَ».

٤. «مَا كَانَ رَبُّكَ نَسِيًّا».

٥. «مَا يَعْزُبُ عَنْ رَبِّكَ مِنْ مِثْقَالِ ذَرَّةٍ».

٦. «إِنَّ وَلِيَّيَ اللَّهُ الَّذِي نَزَّلَ الْكِتَابَ وَهُوَ يَتَوَلَّى الصَّالِحِينَ».

righteous. If others are the owners of the land for testing and thus borrowing, he will be the heir of the land: "...and verily we have written in the Scripture, after the Reminder: My righteous slaves will inherit the earth," (Anbīyā': 105)¹ "...the earth is Allah's. He giveth it for an inheritance to whom He will" ('A'rāf: 128).²

When a person reaches the safe position of sincerity and becomes one of the righteous, he is under the guardianship of God and the devil has confessed that he has no way to that position: "Save Thy single-minded slaves among them." (Sād: 83).³

However, the same devil attacks ordinary human beings from six directions and is mischievous. The tool of Satan's work is delusion and image; but if these two are under the power of reason, they are wise in the conduct of the assistant, and he has no disturbance from within, nor from without, and when he attains the secure position of sincerity, in the position of knowledge, the manifestation of knowledge, in the position of power, the manifestation of power and the position of infallibility, it is the manifestation of: "And they find all that they did confronting them, and thy Lord wrongeth no-one." (Kahf: 49).⁴

And in the position of goodness, it is the manifestation of the one who: "The evil of all that is hateful in the sight of thy Lord."⁵ ('Isrā': 38).

All these [deeds] are displeasing to your Lord (Jawādī Āmulī, 2009, p.66).

7. Denial of Forgetfulness of the Prophet

The denial of the forgetfulness of the prophets can be proved by the following reasons:

7-1. Verbal reason

The possibility of mistake or forgetfulness about the Prophet leads to lack of trust in his reports, orders, and judgments, and as a result the Sunnah of the Prophet will not be valid; while the Sunnah of the Prophet, that is, his actions and deeds, his words, his silence, his resurrection, and his coming, is the model of the Ummah and a proof for them. (In the prayer of Al-e-Yāsīn, greetings and devotion are given to all the affairs of Imam Mahdi (AS), because all the affairs of that Imam are right and he does not perform any act or deed without God's care). If mistake and forgetfulness are found in the actions and deeds of the Prophet, where he is silent, it is probable that his silence is due to inadvertence and forgetfulness, and such silence is not a matter of explanation, and where he does something or speaks, there is a possibility of inadvertent excess and deficiency. And where he recites the verses of revelation to the people, the possibility of decreasing and increasing inadvertently is quite raised. Sheikh Sadūq considered the inadvertence of the Prophet permissible and returned it to the hands of God towards the Prophet. Such an answer and solution not only does not solve the problem, but also adds to the problem.

The principle of the error of the Prophet is rejected for various reasons, so how can it be attributed to God and said that God removes things from the

¹. «أَنَّ الْأَرْضَ يَرِثُهَا عِبَادِيَ الصَّالِحُونَ».
². «إِنَّ الْأَرْضَ لِلَّهِ يُورِثُهَا مَنْ يَشَاءُ مِنْ عِبَادِهِ».
³. «إِلَّا عِبَادَكَ مِنْهُمْ الْمُخْلِصِينَ».

⁴. «وَلَا يَظْلِمُ رَبُّكَ أَحَدًا».
⁵. «كُلُّ ذَلِكَ كَانَ سَيِّئُهُ عِنْدَ رَبِّكَ مَكْرُوهًا».

memory of the Prophet?! If the mistake of the Prophet is possible because every mistake goes back to the essence of God, the mistake of the Prophet also returns to God, and if it is attributed to other than God in the case of the essence, it is close to validity, otherwise it is not possible to create an action, a description, an accident, etc. in the world and this creature may not be attributed to God. Of course, the ruling of the cause of near and far is always reserved. In any case, if his error is possible, all the words, behaviors, silences and deeds of the Prophet will be discredited.

7-2. Philosophical reason

With the ascension of the soul to the status of intellectual abstraction, there is no room left for the influence of Satan to decrease or increase in the scientific field of such an ascending abstract soul as a result of his intervention. The status of complete abstraction is the place of permanent presence and appearance, not negligence; therefore, Abu Ali Sina, while praising the greatness of the prophets (PBUT), says: "Prophets who don't do any error unintentionally or intentionally." This rational reason is so conclusive that it must be justified even if the narrative appearances are the opposite.

7-3. Qur'anic reason

In some verses of the Holy Qur'an, the infallibility of the prophets (PBUT) is used in matters such as forgetfulness. The most important reason for proving the claim regarding the Holy Prophet (PBUH) is the noble verse: "We shall

make thee read (O Muhammad) so that thou shalt not forget." ('A'lā: 6).¹

Interpretations such as the present verb "you shall not forget" in terms of its special content and is obsolete from a certain time, so that it covers the whole range of time and land and language, it is not specific to the present and future so as not to include the past; as using the past tense in the following verse: "how I strengthened thee with the holy Spirit" (Mā'idah: 110).

It is not incapable of including the present and the future, but the past verb includes the present and the future and the present verb includes the past.

Note: Some people have considered it permissible to forget the Holy Prophet (PBUH) if forgetfulness is accompanied by a reminder. But the pure heart of the Holy Prophet (PBUH), who has the highest degree of divine revelation, is safe from the harm of such notions; as he is innocent of the illusion of the permission of the Prophet (PBUH) to forget after preaching and protecting Muslims.

8. Some Important Verses of the Forgetfulness of the Prophets (AS)

One of the Mutashābihat of the Qur'an that can be solved by referring to its Muḥkamat is the verses whose initial revelation and before referring to Muḥkamat is the forgetfulness of the prophets, including the Holy Prophet (PBUH), some of which are referred to:

A) When thou sees men engaged in vain discourse about Our Signs, turn away from them unless they turn to a different theme. If Satan ever makes thee forget, then after recollection, sit

¹ «سنقرنک فالانسى».

not thou in the company of those who do wrong. (An‘ām : 68).

In some of their meetings, the polytheists of the Hejaz conspired to the detriment of Islam and the Prophet (PBUH), or ridiculed them. In this noble verse, God Almighty sent this verse to the Holy Prophet (PBUH).

Answer: First, this holy verse refers to the "possibility of forgetfulness" as a conditional theorem, not to its actuality. Secondly, the internal witness as a connected companion and also the external witness indicates that the verse doesn't mean the Holy Prophet (PBUH), but the audience of the verse is the people. However, the internal witness is that there is no presumption that the Prophet of Islam (PBUH) should be present in a meeting that is conspired, insulted and ridiculed to the detriment of Islam and Muslims and the Prophet (PBUH) himself, so that God forbids him to attend such a meeting! Because such a meeting is not like the session of occultation, lies and slander, so that the presumption of the presence of the Prophet (PBUH) and divine prohibition can be depicted about it; as the enemies in the presence of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) also stopped such mere conspiracies. But the external witness is the rebellion in obeying the divine command due to the domination of Satan over the Prophet. The Satan himself said: I have no way over the sincere servants,"; "He said: Then, by Thy might, I surely will beguile them every one, Save Thy single-minded slaves among them." (Sād: 82-83).¹

Of course, Satan's confession does not mean his respect for perfect human

beings and respect for their privacy, but indicates his helplessness for the attainment of their high position. Satan has the power to mislead those who are afflicted with the world and its tricks, such as wealth and lust, but the divine pious people have abandoned the world and all its splendor, seeking things that Satan has no access to them. God Almighty narrates some attributes in the Qur'an for the sincere [Yūsuf: 24; Šāffāt: 40, 74, 128, 160 and 169].

These attributes are not compatible with the possibility of the devil penetrating their hearts; not only are they not misled by Satan's efforts, but their faith is strengthened; because according to "and whithersoever ye turn, there is Allah's Countenance" (Baqarah: 115)², Satan and all his movements and actions are divine signs, and the sincere increase the strength of their faith by observing these signs and by recognizing and perceiving the devil's deceptions and acting against the devil's wishes.

Another external witness is the verse: "He hath already revealed unto you in the Scripture that, when ye hear the revelations of Allah rejected and derided, (ye) sit not with them (who disbelieve and mock) until they engage in some other conversation. Lo! in that case (if ye stayed) ye would be like unto them. Lo! Allah will gather hypocrites and disbelievers, all together, into hell." (Nisā': 140).³

The meaning of this verse is: God has already instructed you in the Holy Qur'an not to accompany the disbelievers in the meetings of disbelief and mockery of the divine revelations

¹ «قال فيعزتك لأغويتهم أجمعين إلا عبادك منهم المخلصين».

² «فأينما تولوا فثم وجه الله».

³ «و قد نزل عليكم في الكتاب أن إذا سمعتم آيات الله يكفر بها و يستهزء بها فلا تقعدوا معهم حتى يخوضوا في حديث غيره إنكم إذا مثلهم إن الله جامع المنافقين و الكافرين في جهنم جميعاً».

until they may enter into another speech, and if you attend such meetings you are like the hypocrites and the infidels and God gathers the hypocrites and the disbelievers together in Hell. Attending a meeting in which the divine revelations are mocked and insulted is not just corrupting, as in the past, such as attending a meeting of absenteeism and slander, but such attendance is beyond the ordinary great sin and it is blasphemous.

Is it supposed that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) participate in a meeting in which attending will bring the participant among the hypocrites and infidels, and will place him in the burning hell of God? On the other hand, looking at the whole of the Holy Qur'an, we find that such guidance cannot be found except in Surah An'am, which is Makkī (verse 68), and in Surah An-Nisā', which is Madanī, God Almighty says to the people: You "had such a guide", so the following verse certainly means: "He hath already revealed unto you in the Scripture..." (Nisā': 140).¹

The same guidance that is mentioned in Surah An'am, and accordingly, the verse of Surah An-Nisā' will be the interpreter of the verse of Surah An'am and it will be revealed, although in Surah "An'am" it refers to the Holy Prophet (PBUH): "and when you see...turn from it...He will forget you....so don't sit..."² But because in the verse of Surah An-Nisā' it is addressed to the general public: "It was sent down to you...when you hear...don't sit...indeed you..."³

It turns out that the address in Surah An'am due to: is apparently to the Holy Prophet (PBUH) and is in fact to the Ummah, and it does not include the Holy Prophet; as it is stated in some narrations that some of God's addresses to the Holy Prophet (PBUH) are from this type.

B) "And he said unto him of the twain who he knew would be released: Mention me in the presence of thy lord. But Satan caused him to forget to mention it to his lord, so he (Joseph) stayed in prison for some years." (Yūsuf: 42).⁴

C) Prophet Yūsuf (AS), after interpreting the dream of the prisoners, said to one of them who knew that he would be released: "Remember me with your Lord." Regarding the phrase, some have thought that it means that Satan dominated Prophet Yusuf (AS) and that he forgot the remembrance of his God due to Satan's domination over his heart; therefore, this verse is one of the verses that apparently attributes forgetfulness to some of the divine prophets (PBUT).

Answer: The sentence cited means that the devil took control of the person who was the butler of tavern of Potiphar and the companion of Prophet Yūsuf (AS) in prison and make him forget the order of Prophet Yūsuf (AS); hence, he did not convey the message of Prophet Yūsuf to his Lord, not that Satan took control of Yūsuf (AS) and removed the remembrance of God from his heart; for, first, in the above verses, there is talk of the "Lord" in three places: "...As for one of you, he will serve wine to his master... Mention me in the presence of

¹ «و قد نزل عليكم في الكتاب...».

² «و إذا رأيت... فأعرض... ينسينك... فلا تقعد...».

³ «و قد نزل عليكم... إذا سمعتم... فلا تقعدوا... إنكم...».

⁴ «و قال للذي ظن أنه ناجٍ منهما اذكرني عند ربك فأنساه الشيطان ذكر ربّه فلبث في السجن بضع سنين».

thy lord. But Satan caused him to forget to mention it to his lord” (Yūsuf: 41-42).¹

The first two cases refer to the Lord and the person who was rescued from prison, and the third and final case to the testimony of context unity must mean that the devil make the butler forget the order of Prophet Yūsuf (AS) and he did not mention Prophet Yūsuf (AS) to his master. Thus, the "remembrance of the Lord" refers to the saved person, not to Yūsuf (AS) and forgetfulness is the description of the saved person that was obtained due to the forgetfulness made by Satan. Secondly, the holy Qur'an is glorified for considering a tyrant as the Lord of Prophet Yūsuf (AS); so that Yūsuf (AS) is innocent of considering himself the servant of a tyrant; because in the same surah "Yūsuf" the monotheistic guiding words of Prophet Yūsuf (AS) have been narrated to two of his companions as follows: “O my fellow-prisoners! Are divers lords better, or Allah the One, Almighty?” (Yūsuf: 39).²

God Almighty is not only one and has no partner, but His unity is omnipotent and leaves no room for the illusion of a partner in the Lordship. The unique that has the second is not strong; because nothing is subjugated by him, but a unique that has no second defeats every notion and defeats every illusion by Unity.

Thirdly, Prophet Yūsuf (AS) had a constant remembrance of his Lord, God Almighty, and from the beginning and end of his story about the prison, which begins with verse 32 and ends with verse

55 of Surah Yūsuf, it is clear that from the tongue of Prophet Yūsuf (AS) has not raised anything except monotheism and expressing the litigation has not been contrary to monotheism; because every oppressed person is obliged not to fall under the domination of the oppressor and to use his litigation as a means of eliminating oppression, and monotheistic belief never means silence against the oppression of tyrants.

D) “And when Moses said unto his servant: I will not give up until I reach the point where the two rivers meet, though I march on for ages. And when they reached the point where the two met, they forgot their fish, and it took its way into the waters, being free.” (Kahf: 60-61).³

Moses (PBUH), along with his companion, Joshua, took the road to reach the meeting place with Hadrat Khidr (AS) so Moses (PBUH) to learn divine science from him, and the meeting place was the location of the two seas, where their provisions (fish) fell into the sea. When they reached the confluence of the two seas, they forgot their fish, and the fish jumped in the sea made its way and left. When they passed by that place, Moses (PBUH) said to his companion Joshua: Bring our food because we suffered a lot from this journey; “And when they had gone further, he said unto his servant: Bring us our breakfast. Verily we have found fatigue in this our journey.” (Kahf: 62).⁴

Joshua said: "When we took refuge in that rock, I forgot [reporting the resuscitating or jumping] of the dead fish [into the sea], and no one except

¹. «... فيسقى ربّه... ..!اذكرني عند ربك فأناشاه الشيطان ذكر ربّه...».

². «يا صاحبي السجن أرباب متفرقون خير أم الله الواحد القهار».

³. «و إذ قال موسى لفتاه لا أبرح حتى أبلغ مجمع البحرين أو أمضى حقبا فلما بلغنا مجمع بينهما نسيا حوتهما فاتخذ سبيله في البحر سربا».

⁴. «فلما جاوزا قال لفتاه أتنا غداً لنا لقد لقينا من سفرنا هذا نصبا».

Satan made me forget it, and strangely the fish made his way to the sea; "He said: Didst thou see, when we took refuge on the rock, and I forgot the fish - and none but Satan caused me to forget to mention it - it took its way into the waters by a marvel." (Kahf: 63).¹

In these verses, forgetfulness is attributed to Prophet Moses (PBUH) and his companion.

Answer: Although in verse 61 of Surah Al-Kahf, forgetfulness was attributed to Moses (PBUH) and his companion Joshua, (they forgot their fish), but it is clear from the following verses that its true attribute is to the companion of Prophet Moses (PBUH); hence, he says: "I forgot the fish. Indeed, Satan has made me to forget"²

That is, I forgot to report to you the resuscitation of the fish or his falling into the sea. Joshua saw the falling of the fish into the sea and was responsible for announcing and reporting to Moses (PBUH). If the responsibility of reminding was shared between Moses and his companion, forgetfulness in this verse would be attributed to both of them. However, attributing the influence of Satan in the companion of Prophet Moses (PBUH) is not forbidden; because, first of all, he (assuming prophecy) was not one of the Ulu al-'Azm prophets. Secondly, such seizures, which are purely customary and do not tempt the legislature or its subject matter, can be attributed to some prophets; as it is also narrated that the body of Prophet Ayyub (AS) was seized and harmed by Satan: "And make mention (O Muhammad) of Our

bondman Job, when he cried unto his Lord (saying): Lo! the devil doth afflict me with distress and torment."³

Just as cold, heat, poison, and the sword are effective in the bodies of the prophets, and many of them have been martyred with these injuries, so the harms of Satan affect their bodies, and Satan's interference in the companion of Moses (PBUH) can also be of such seizures. What is the narrated and rational reason for its transformation is the effect of Satan's temptation on the infallibles (PBUT) and the disruption of the work of conveying their mission and guidance; so as to invalidate their action or promise.

"(Moses) said: Be not wroth with me that I forgot, and be not hard upon me for my fault." (Kahf: 73)⁴

This verse also ostensibly attributes forgetfulness to Prophet Moses (PBUH).

Answer: Hadrat Khidr (AS) refused to accompany Prophet Musa (PBUH) because Khidr (AS) acted on the basis of guardianship and inwardness, and Musa (PBUH), who was a prophet and guardian of appearances, acted on the basis of Shari'a and could not tolerate Khidr's deeds. Khidr (AS) said: "How can you wait for something that you do not know"? Moses (PBUH) also said: God willing, you will find me patient and I will not disobey you in anything; And finally Khidr (AS) said to Musa (PBUH): Did I not say that you can never be patient with me and Moses (PBUH) said: Do not rebuke me because of what I forgot, and do not be hard on me in my work.

١. «قال أرأيت إذ أوتينا إلى الصخرة فإني نسيت الحوت وما انسينيه إلا الشيطان أن أذكره و اتخذ سبيله في البحر عجيباً».
٢. «فإني نسيت الحوت وما أنسانيه إلا الشيطان أن أذكره...».

٣. «و اذكر عبدنا أيوب إذ نادى ربه أتى مسنى الشيطان بنصب و عذاب».
٤. «قال لا تؤاخذنى بما نسيت و لاترهقنى من أمرى عسراً».

Some commentators have said: "(I forgot) in this verse means "I abandoned" (Ṭabrasī, 1981, p.747); I mean, I gave up my commitment and you do not take it hard on me and I hope I can wait, I try to remember the covenant and not forget it. In many cases, Khidr (AS) said that you cannot be patient and tolerant and never said that you, who made a commitment not to forget so why you forgot, forgetfulness of the covenant has no role here; because if Moses (PBUH) had mentioned it, according to Khidr (AS) he would not have been able to tolerate it and he would protest (Jawādī Āmulī, 2010, p.111-117).

9. The Narratives of Sahw al-Nabī

As mentioned before, Imamiyyah considered the prophets (PBUH) infallible and believe that the prophets do not make any mistake in receiving revelation, preservation, maintenance, propaganda and execution, as well as in their actions otherwise people's trust is taken away from them; because with the possibility of their mistake, the confidence and calmness is completely disappeared. However, there are narrations about the quality of the prayer of the Messenger of God (PBUH) in which he prayed two raka'ah instead of four raka'ah, or he recited the four raka'ah prayer in five raka'ah¹.

Now we will express the opinions of the scholars about the "Sahw al-Nabī": "Sheikh Tūsī" has said in Tahzīb: "The narrations of Sahw al-Nabī are not in accordance with our religion and the intellect refuses to accept them." He also

wrote about hadith "Dhi Al-Shamalayn" in his book Istibṣār and has said about Sahw al-Nabī: "مما تمنع منه الأدلة القاطعة في أنه: "لا يجوز على السهو والغلط".

Sheikh Sadūq, who is known for accepting the "Sahw al-Nabī", says: "The mistake of the Prophet is not like the mistake of other people; because his mistake is from God - the Exalted - and in fact it is "Asha"² and throwing in error; to make it clear that the Prophet is also a human being, lest the people call him a deity and turn away from God, and this is contrary to the mistake of other people, which is from the devil and his influence, while the devil has no dominion on the Prophet and the religious leaders³.

Therefore, the mistake of Prophet (PBUH) is different from leading the Prophet (PBUH) to make a mistake. That is, the mistake of the Prophet is like the death of the Prophet and... .

Of course, we are talking about the mistake and forgetfulness of the Prophet (PBUH) which many Sunni and Shiite scholars do not accept. Hence, "Muhaqiq al-Tūsī" said in Tajrīd al-I'tiqād: "And it is obligatory for the prophet to be infallible to be authenticand also not error."⁴

Allameh Hillī wrote in the commentary on Tajrīd: "And it is obligatory for the prophet...he should not have error because he has to bring the divine message to people without fault."⁵

It is not permissible for him to inadvertently forget some of what he is commissioned to propagate. Muḥaqiq

¹. «إن رسول الله سها فسلم في ركعتين ثم ذكر حديث ذي الشمالين (ذو اليمين) فقال ثم قام فأضاف ركعتين».

². إسها

³. «و ليس للشيطان على النبي (ص) و الائمة سلطان (إنما سلطانه على الذين يتولونه و الذين هم به مشركون) و على من اتبعه من الغاوين».

⁴. «و يجب في النبي العصمة ليحصل الوثوق... و عدم السهو».

⁵. «و يجب في النبي...أن لا يصح عليه السهو لئلا يسهو ما أمر بتبليغه».

Awwal writes in the book *Nāfi'*: "The truth is that the position of Imamate (including Nubuwwat and Imamate) is higher than that to be inadvertent in worship." Allameh Ḥillī also said in the book *Muntahī*: The hadith of "Abu Hurayrah" (about Sahw al-Nabī) is false to us; because it is impossible for the prophets to be mistaken.

Also in the mentioned book and in the book of *Tadhkirah*, after mentioning Abu Hurayrah's news about "Dhu al-Yadayn", he rejected this hadith in some ways:

1. It implies a mistake in the right of the Prophet (PBUH) which is intellectually impossible.
2. Islam of Abu Hurayrah is two years after the death of Dhu al-Yadayn.

The "first martyr" has said in a *dhikr* after mentioning the news of Dhu al-Yadayn: "And it is abandoned in Imamiyah because of rational proof of the immune of the Prophet from errors."¹

"Fadhil Miqdād" (AD 826 AH) writes: "It is not allowed for the Prophet (PBUH) to have errors, either in Shari'ah or the other."²

"Allameh Majlisī" also writes after mentioning the useful words of the past: Imamiyyah have a consensus on the infallibility of the prophets and imams (PBUT) from minor and major sins, intentional and unintentional and due to oblivion, before prophecy and Imamate and after it, but from birth to the death, and no one has opposed it; except for Sheikh Sadūq, Muhammad ibn Babawayh and his teacher "Ibn Walīd".

These two nobles have considered "Asha" possible from God, not a mistake from Satan; however, the opposition of these two people does not harm the consensus (and the invalidity of the Prophet's mistake remains the same), it seems that most of the companions of Imamiyyah also agree on the issue that prophets don't make a mistake in the obligations and prohibitions such as permissibility and abominations; as several verses and hadiths indicate it; such as: "Nor doth he speak of (his own) desire. It is naught save an inspiration that is inspired."³

Sheikh Mufid has considered the hadiths of "Sahw al-Nabī" as among the enemies of the Ahl al-Bayt and their Shiite imitators; in particular, he considered their difference in whether it was the noon or evening prayer as the reason for the weakness of this hadith and its non-authority and the reason for ruling that it is obligatory to abandon it. He writes in his treatise: "The weakness of this narration (narration of Dhu al-Yadayn) is like the weakness of the news in which it is stated that the Prophet (PBUH) made a mistake in the morning prayer and in the first rak'ah, he recited Surah Al-Najm to the verses: "Have ye thought upon Al-Lat and Al-'Uzza. And Manat, the third, the other?" (Najm: 19-20)⁴ Then the devil uttered the phrase:

«تلك الغرائق العلى و إن شفاعتهن لترتجى»

Then the Prophet realized. Hence, He prostrated and the Muslims prostrated after him. The polytheists also prostrated out of joy and happiness and

¹ «و هو متروك بين الإمامية لقيام الدليل العقلي على عصمة النبي عن السهو».

² «لا يجوز على النبي (ص) السهو مطلقاً، أى فى الشرع و غيره».

³ «وما ينطق عن الهوى * إن هو إلا وحي يوحى».

⁴ «فأرأيتم اللات والعزى * و مناة الثالثة الأخرى».

thought that the Prophet had entered their religion.

If it is possible that the Prophet (PBUH) made a mistake in his prayer (while he is the Imam of the congregation) and turned away before the prayer end and people saw and warned him, he should also make a mistake in fasting and he may eat and drink on the day of the holy month of Ramadan. And people should stare at him and say to him: It is Ramadan, what is this wrongdoing that you are doing? Stop this transgression ... and during the rituals of Hajj and in ihram, he may do "sa'iy" before "Ṭawāf" and he does not know how to do "Ramy Jamarāt"; rather, it should be possible for him to make a mistake in all the acts of the Shari'ah and to change their limit in other times, and it is not a fault if he forgot and drank alcohol or thought that wine was lawful, and then the matter became clear to him. There is nothing wrong with him announcing himself or anyone else who is not his Lord.

These are all things that no Muslim, no exaggerator, no monotheist accept it; therefore, the one who prescribes the mistake of the Prophet has gone beyond moderation and caused a disgrace. (In addition to this) there is no person known as "Dhu al-Yadayn" and we have not found any hadith about this man in the principles or in the narrators, nor has there been any mention of him.

As a result, "Sahwal Nabī" (PBUH) is rejected in all aspects. Knowledge of prophecy and pure knowledge of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) removes the possibility of any scientific or practical defect from the deep understanding of the researcher." (Jawādī Āmulī, 2005, p.287 and Ibid, 2008, p.107).

10. Answers to the Doubts

Opponents of the infallibility of the prophets have raised doubts about their infallibility and its extent from verses of the Qur'an and hadiths. Since this article deals with the issue of the extent of the infallibility of the prophets from the Imamiyyah point of view, on this basis, as an example, some of the doubts of the opponents in the extent of the discussion are mentioned from the verses of the holy Qur'an.

Some verses of the Qur'an have interpretations about the states of some prophets that may be considered contrary to the infallibility of the prophets; like the verse: "Adam disobeyed his Lord, and went amiss." (Tāhā: 121).¹

This verse is the clearest verse that can be used to criticize the infallibility of the prophets, but it should be noted that "rebellion" in the word means opposition to the command and we know that the command is of two types: "Positive" and "Negative". Opposing the positive is contrary to infallibility, but opposing the negative does not contradict infallibility. "Ghawāyah", which is attributed to Adam, also means losses. Obviously, leaving a negative command i.e. a prohibiting command also requires lack of a virtue and it is a kind of loss.

The degree of measurement of deeds and their being or not being a guilt in every Shari'a has its positive and negative rulings, and the rulings on punishment and purification, which are in opposition to the permission, do not interfere in this matter. In this test, the Prophet is completely free from sin and transgression, but according to the high

¹ «وَعَصَىٰ آدَمُ رَبَّهُ فَغَوَىٰ».

position of the Prophet, he is naturally tested with a more accurate device, the violation of which is not in the general sense of sin and transgression, but because it is not worthy of the position of prophecy, if he commits such an act, which is considered disgusting by the special measure of the prophets, he will be reprimanded. This difference in measurement goes as far as the "حسنات" but such violations never contradict the infallibility of the prophets, and the infallibility of the prophets, which is evaluated with the same degree of measurement of the Shari'a, is fixed for the prophets. Again in measuring the deeds of the prophets with different degrees and positions in the presence of God Almighty, the measurement becomes more and more accurate. It is as what is seen in the Holy Qur'an related to the rebellion and error of the prophets, as well as what is seen in the prayers of the prophets and the infallible Imams (AS) from confessing their sins to God and asking for forgiveness and insisting on repentance, and never contradicts their infallibility. (A group of authors, 2005, p.151).

But Ayatollah Jawādī Āmulī responds to the doubt about the above verse and the infallibility of Prophet Adam as follows: "Although Prophet Adam (PBUH) was affected by both the temptation and the seduction of Satan before his descent into the realm of nature: but this verse cannot be specific to the verses: "He said: Then, by Thy might, I surely will beguile them every one, Save Thy single-minded slaves among them." (Sād: 82-83)¹; "He said:

My Lord! Because Thou hast sent me astray, I verily shall adorn the path of error for them in the earth, and shall mislead them every one. Save such of them as are Thy perfectly devoted slaves." (Hijr: 39-40)²

As the verse «عَصَىٰ آدَمُ رَبَّهُ فَغَوَىٰ» cannot be answered by the reasons of prophets' infallibility.

This rebellion has been before the revelation and the descent to the earth, there is no talk of Wājib, Ḥarām, Makrūh and Mustahab, because the Shari'ah began after the descent of Adam (PBUH) to the earth." (Jawādī Āmulī, 2010, p.217); "We said: Go down, all of you, from hence; but verily there cometh unto you from Me a guidance; and whoso followeth My guidance, there shall no fear come upon them neither shall they grieve. But they who disbelieve, and deny Our revelations, such are rightful Peoples of the Fire. They will abide therein." (Baqarah: 38-39).³

Elsewhere, he says: "The glorious point that has been remained obscure and hidden from most of the writings of the commentators is that although they distinguished between the period before the Nubuwwah of the Prophet and the stage after his Nubuwwah, they did not address the important issue that there is a difference between the "Period of Fatrat" and before the emergence of the principle of the phenomenon of legislative prophecy and the difference between the "Period of Fatrat" and after the emergence of its principle; because in the story of Adam (PBUH) apart from the difference that exists between the

¹ «قَالَ قَبِيزَتِكَ لِأَعْوَابِهِمْ أَجْمَعِينَ لِإِعْبَادِكَ مِنْهُمْ الْمُخْلِصِينَ».

² «قَالَ رَبِّ بِمَا أَغْوَيْتَنِي لَأُزَيِّنَنَّ لَهُمْ فِي الْأَرْضِ وَ لَأُغْوِيَنَّهُمْ أَجْمَعِينَ لِإِعْبَادِكَ مِنْهُمْ الْمُخْلِصِينَ».

³ «قُلْنَا اهْبِطُوا مِنْهَا جَمِيعًا فَإِمَّا يَأْتِيَنَّكُمْ مِنِّي هُدًى فَمَنْ تَبِعَ هُدَايَ فَلَا خَوْفَ عَلَيْهِمْ وَ لَا هُمْ يَحْزَنُونَ* وَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا وَ كَذَّبُوا بِآيَاتِنَا أُولَٰئِكَ أَصْحَابُ النَّارِ هُمْ فِيهَا خَالِدُونَ».

period before and after his Nubuwwah, like the two periods of the life of any other prophet, there is another essential difference that is not evident in other prophets, and that is that Adam (PBUH) left behind a period in which no legislative prophecy has been forged at all in the world of possibility, and in such an atmosphere no ruling can be Inferred from the false religious Shari'ah; because it is assumed that there was no Shari'ah in the world at all; therefore, raising the issue of infallibility in such a situation is different from raising it in the atmosphere of Shariah (Jawādī Āmulī, 2010, p.417).

CONCLUSION

Infallibility is the final degree of faith and success and grace with which the infallibles are protected from sins and wrongdoings in the religion of God, and it is a favor from God to the one whom God knows, who clings to his infallibility, and accepting infallibility is the work of the infallible. Infallibility never prevents the power over sin, nor does it force a person to do good deeds. Infallibility from error and sin are two necessities that are necessary for the prophets; because its absence has deprived the people of trust and the Prophet cannot fulfill his mission.

Islamic scholars have accepted the infallibility of the prophets, but they differ in their quality and degree, some believe that infallibility is after Bi'thah and some say that infallibility is before Bi'thah. Also, some have considered the Prophet only as infallible from major sin and intentional sin, and some considered the Prophet as infallible from major and minor sins, inadvertence and forgetfulness.

In this research, we have considered the scope and realm of infallibility from the perspective of the Imamiyyah Shiites.

In the view of the Imamiyyah, infallibility has degrees and levels, and the infallibility of the prophets from sin and error is different. Infallibility includes two types of practical and scientific, which in the practical dimension, keeps man from sin, and in the scientific dimension protects man from ignorance, error, mistake, forgetfulness and fallacy in thought, therefore, Innocent humans have divine immunity in terms of theoretical and practical intellect; they both understand correctly and implement what they have understood correctly, and there is no defect or forgetfulness in their perceptive power and their actions are not influenced by intentional sin and rebellion. Thus, the infallible is said to be someone who has a strong spiritual power, is fully aware of the ugliness of sin, and has a strong will to moderate and control his instinctual tendencies in all circumstances.

References:

- The Holy Quran.*
 Ibn Fāris, Ahmad ibn Zakariya (1418 AH), *Mu'jam-u Maḳāyīs al-Lughah*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.
 Ibn Bābiwayh, Abu Ja'far Muhammad (2007), *Al-'Itiqādāt (Translation into Persian by: Seyed Muhammad Ali Ghale Kohnei)*, Tehran: Rah-e Elm.
 Akbari, Reza and Mansouri, Abbas Ali (2010), "Mulla Sadra's View on the Infallibility of the Prophets from Sin", *Quarterly Journal of Religious Thought*, Shiraz University, 37: pp. 20-1.

Badpa, Mohammad Kazem (2009), *Prophet of Mercy*, Qom: Isra, 2nd ed.

A Group of Authors (2005), *Islamic Education 2*, Tehran: Printing and Publishing Organization of the Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance, 27th ed.

Javadi Amoli, Abdullah (2009), *The Behavior of the Nearests' Death*, Research: Mohammad Musaffaei, Qom: Isra, 5th ed.

Rahimuf, Afzaluddin (2010), "The Study of the Issue of the Infallibility of the Prophets from the Perspective of Sheikh Tusī and Fakhruddin Rāzī," *Toloo' Magazine*, 32: pp. 74-50.

Zamani Ghomshei, Ali (2005), *Revelation and Prophecy in the Qur'an*, Qom: Isra, 2nd ed.

Shariati, Mohammad Taqi (1967), *New Interpretation*, Tehran: Sherkat-e Sahami Enteshar.

Sadeghi, Seyed Mahmoud (2010), *The Counterpart of the Qur'an and Ahl al-Bayt (AS)*, Qom: Isra.

Sadeghi, Seyed Mahmoud (2008), *The Breeze of Thought*, Qom: Isra.

Sadeghi Uruzagani, Mohammad Amin (2004), *Infallibility*, Qom: Qom Seminary Management Center Publications.

Sadr al-Mutallahin, Muhammad ibn Ibrahim (1987), *Tafsīr al-Qur'an al-'Azīm*, Research: Mohammad Khajavi, Qom: Bidar, 2nd ed.

Ṭabarsī Fadlah Ibn Hassan (1981), *Translation of Majma' Al-Bayān fī*

Tafsīr Al-Qur'an, Research: Mohammad Javad Balāghī. Tehran: Farahani

Tūsī, Muhammad ibn Hassan (1383), *Tamhīd al-'Usūl*, Tehran: University of Tehran.

Tūsī, Muhammad ibn Hassan (1406 AH). *Al-'Iqtisād fī Mā Yata'allaq bih al-'Iṭiqād*, Beirut: Dar Al-Adwā', 2nd ed.

Abedini, Abdul Karim (2010), *The Commentary of Tasnim*, Qom: Isra', volume 14, 2nd ed.

Qodsi, Ahmad (2010), *The Commentary of Tasnim*, Qom: Isra', volume 3, 5th ed.

Qsīr Āmilī, Ahmad (nd), *Al-Tibyān fī Tafsīr al-Qur'an*, Beirut: Dar 'Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī.

Mohammadi Reyshahri, Mohammad (1981), *Philosophy of Revelation and Prophecy*, Qom: Islamic Publications Office.

Muzaffar, Mohammad Reza (2003), *Aqā'id al-Imāmīyah*, Translated by Alireza Masjedjame'I, Tehran: Printing and Publishing Organization of the Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance, 2nd ed.

Nasri, Abdullah (1986), *Basics of the Mission of the Prophets in the Qur'an*, Tehran: Jahad-e Daneshgahi, 2nd ed.

Waez Mohammadi, Hassan (2010), *The Commentary of Tasnim*, Qom: Isra', volume 6, 8th ed.



پروہشگاہ علوم انسانی و مطالعات فرہنگی
پرتال جامع علوم انسانی