

Tehran Branch in Collaboration with Tehran University), 1974, 400 Rials.

In this edition three reviews by A. Dashtî, R. Dâvarî and H. Yagh-mâ'î have been added to the Persian part, and a French review by G. Vajda (*Journal Asiatique*, Année 1974, pp. 378-379), and an article by the author entitled "Râzî's Kitâb al-Ilm al-Ilâhî and the Five Eternals" (*Abr-Nahrain*, 1972-1973, pp. 16-23) to the English part.

Editor



responsible for correcting them) will correct these typographical mistakes when a second edition appears in the not too distant future.

Another matter which one hesitates to bring up - - except that it is necessary to draw attention to it - - is a point mentioned in the very first paragraph of the English "Preface" of the work, where Dr. Muḥaqqiq states that the second aim of his book on Razi "is to indicate the fact that he was not, as he has been called so often, an 'Arab' philosopher". Of course Dr. Muḥaqqiq very wisely does not even go into this subject at all (except in one solitary footnote. albeit an interesting one, p. 3, n. 6); and therefore this "second aim" of his book is nonexistent. In fact, why would any scholar want to go into anything like that? Whether Muḥammad ibn Zakarāyya of Rayy was "Faylasūf-i 'Arab" or "Faylasūf-i 'Ajam", will knowing this fact or talking about it tell us more about him as perhaps the greatest physician of the whole Medieval world, and one of the most original of philosophers in the Islamic cultural tradition? *Shu'ūbiyah* has long since died, and there is no reason or need to revive it in any way!

One last point worthy of mention is the fact that Dr. Muḥaqqiq in his foreword promises his readers two forthcoming works: one on the religious views of Rāzī, and the other on Hayūlā, time, and space in Islamic and Greek and Alexandrian philosophy. Students of Muslim theology and philosophy will be waiting anxiously for the appearance of these two future studies.

Princeton University
Department of Near Eastern Studies

Michel M. Mazzaoui

February 15, 1972

Note: The second edition of *Filsūf-i Rayy* had appeared in "Wisdom of Persia Series", no. 14. (Publications of McGill Institute of Islamic Studies

1; but the bibliography, p. 444, gives the number of this MS. as 4583! The value of Rāzī's *Shukūk* (in the author's view, p. 308) lies in uncovering many of Galen's works whose titles only have been known to us, and in the direct references to Rāzī's own works. Also this work enables us for the first time to study Rāzī's philosophical ideas scientifically and critically. Two lists are provided, one for Galen and the other for Rāzī, which describe in detail their works as mentioned in *Shukūk*. A long discussion then follows on Rāzī's views, and those of other Muslim thinkers, regarding Galen's opinion on *hudūth va qidam-i 'ālam*, and the theory of *tawaqquf* in which he is said to have believed.

(d) Chapter twelve of the book, as well as the Supplement that follows that, do not strictly speaking belong to Rāzī. The former is a discussion of a work by Maimonides on Galen (based on Section 25 of Maimonides' *Fuṣūl*); and the latter is Hunayn ibn Ishāq's *Risālah* on the works of Galen translated into Syriac and Arabic "including those not (yet?) translated" (which Hunayn had written to 'Alī ibn Yaḥyā of the court of the 'Abbāsīd Caliph al-Mutawakkil). By including these two sections Dr. Muḥaqqiq has given perspective to Rāzī's views on Galen, his own great predecessor of the second century.

There is not much more to be said in this presentation of Professor Muḥaqqiq's work on Muḥammad ibn Zakarīyyā Rāzī. The intention has been to describe this book in as much detail as possible in order to draw attention to the various subjects treated, and enable students of Muslim philosophy to benefit from the tremendous amount of scholarly research that has gone into the writing of this volume. One can list the numerous typographical errors which a work of this type is susceptible to. The author's *ghalaṭnāmah* at the beginning of the book is certainly incomplete, and perhaps Dr. Muḥaqqiq (who, more than any body else, knows these errors and is

(ii) *Sirat-i falsafī*: Here Dr. Muḥaqqiq has included the Persian translation of the original Arabic of Rāzī's "Philosophic way (of life)", written, as was the case with several other philosophers, to explain his philosophic method and avoid, if possible, the criticisms of unformed writers. Following the translation of this short work, the author adds his learned comments on the subject.

(iii) *Fī al-ladhdhat*: Bīrūnī refers to a work by Rāzī on "Pleasure (and Pain)" and to an "Argument" between Rāzī and Shahīd-i Balkhī on the same subject. Both works are lost, but Prof. Muḥaqqiq resuscitates Rāzī's views on *ladhdhat* from that great Ismā'īlī scholar, Nāṣir-i Khusrōw, in his famous work *Zād al-musāfirīn*. Extensive quotations (pp. 238-48) are drawn to show the views of Rāzī and the refutations by Nāṣir-i Khusrōw, followed by a discussion explaining how Rāzī, as well as other Muslim thinkers, had been influenced by the writings of Plato and Galen in this respect.

(iv) *Ilmī Ilāhī*: Again here since the original text of Rāzī has not survived, Dr. Muḥaqqiq has reconstructed his thoughts on this important philosophical topic from several contemporary and later writers. These include among others Majrītī, ilīyā Naṣībīnī, Ibn Ḥazm (who in his well-known book on sects refers to a separate refutation written by him on Rāzī's work - - Muḥaqqiq, p. 263), Nāṣir-i Khusrōw, Maimonides, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd, and Ibn Taymīyah. A comparative discussion of the views of these scholars on "The Five Eternals" (*qudamā-yi khamsah*: the Creator, the soul, hayūlā, space, and time) concludes this section.

(v) *Shukūk bar Jālinūs*: This is a major study, done here for the first time, of one of Rāzī's most important works. (The late Paul Kraus had planned to publish it under the title *Dubitationes in Galenum*). The discussion is based on MS. 4573 of Malek Library, Tehran - - Muḥaqqiq, p. 299, n.

(14), alchemy (22), atheistic works (2), and miscellaneous (10). For additional information, the author lists in chapter six the titles, and in some cases the descriptions of the 235 books and treatises of Rāzī according to Ibn Abī Uṣaybi‘ah, ‘*Uyūn al-anbā’ fi ṭabaqāt al-a‘ibbā’*. In many cases, of course, Rāzī’s works are not extant; so Dr. Muḥaqqiq has combed a wide range of literature to locate references, and in some cases, extracts from them in other works. To give one example of the author’s thoroughness: on the two so-called atheistic works (*kufriyāt*) of Rāzī, the *Naqḍ al-adyān* and the *Makhāriq al-anbiyā’* (to give them the titles with which they are better known), Dr. Muḥaqqiq has supplied very useful information culled in the first case from Abū Ḥatim Rāzī, Bīrūnī, and Ibn al-Qayyim al-Jawziyah, and in the second from Ibn Abī Uṣaybi‘ah, Muqaddasī, Nidhām al-Mulk, and ‘Abd al-Qāhir al-Baghdādī, (pp. 125-6). It is only with a treatment such as this one here referred to that one can begin to unearth much that has been lost of the great works of Muslim thinkers.

c) Chapters 7-11 are by far the most important contributions in Professor Muḥaqqiq’s work. These five chapters (pp. 155-345) deal with five different aspects of Rāzī’s philosophy based on five of his major works on the subject: *Tibb-i rūḥānī*, *Sīrat-i falsafī*, *Ladhdhat*, ‘*Ilm-i ilāhī*, and *Shukūk bar Jālīnūs*.

(i) *Tibb-i rūḥānī*: The 20-odd sections of which this work is composed are analyzed in detail, and both Rāzī’s debt to the Greek philosophical heritage and his own original contributions are fully described. [Reference has already been made above to Dr. Muḥaqqiq including the English text of his article “The ‘Spiritual Physic’s of Rāzī” published earlier in *Studia Islamica* on the same subject. However, it should be pointed out here that the said article is a much shorter version, and lacks the breath and depth of scholarship which are evident in the Persian discussion.]

Studia Islamica, 26 (1967), pp. 5-22.

After a short foreword (*pishgustār*), Dr. Muḥaqqiq's work falls into 12 chapters and a supplement (*peyvast*). Then come six indexes on the names of persons, groups and sects, places, libraries, technical terms, and sources. Finally, a list of the publications of the Anjuman-i Āthār-i Milli series (of which this work on Rāzī is No. 73) is included together with their dates of publication, and (which is a most welcome idea) a list of the publications of Dr. Muḥaqqiq himself in Persian, Arabic, and English.

The core of the book, i.e. the twelve chapters, may easily be grouped as follows:

a) Chapters 1-4 deal with the life of Rāzī, his teachers, his students, and those persons whose works Rāzī had refuted. These include Abū al-Qāsim Balkhī, Masma'i, Shahīd-i Balkhī, Nāshī, Sarakhsī, and Aḥmad ibn Kayyāl. This section which covers pp. 5-49 of the book is a welcome addition to the biographical sketch of Rāzī done for the first edition of the *Encyclopaedia of Islām* sometime ago by P. Kraus and S. Pines. Dr. Muḥaqqiq has utilized his vast bibliographical knowledge to put together in a more or less definitive way the little that we know about Rāzī's life.

b) Chapter 5 and 6 deal with Rāzī's works (pp. 53-151). This section, especially chapter 5, is the most complete listing of the compositions of one of the greatest minds of the Islamic cultural tradition done by one of the most competent and learned representatives of that tradition. Every item is treated separately with detailed information on the subject matter, and references from contemporary and later writers, as well as manuscript locations where applicable. Rāzī's works are here classified into specific headings: medical (56), physics (33), logic (7), mathematics and astronomy (10), commentaries and summaries of philosophical and medical works written by others (7), philosophical works (17), metaphysics (6), theology

فیلسوفی: محمد بن زکریای رازی
مهدی محقق

Mahdī Muḥaqqiq (Mohaghegh), *Faylasūf-i Rayy: Muḥammad ibn-i Zakariyyā-yi Rāzī*, (Silsilah-yi Intishārāt-i Anjuman-i Āthār-i Milli, No. 73), Tehran, 1349 hijrī/shamsī. [Added title-page in English; *Filsūf-i-Rayy: Muḥammad Ibn-i-Zakariyā-i-Rāzī*, (The Society for Protection of National Monuments, No. 73), Tehran, 1970.]; xiv, 463 pp. (+ 27 pp. in English); 250 rials.

* * *

This work is a major contribution by Dr. Mahdī Muḥaqqiq, professor at the Faculty of Arts and Humanities of Tehran University, on the life, times, and philosophical ideas of the great Muslim and Medieval physician Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī (865-925). Professor Muḥaqqiq has been working on Rāzī for several years, and has devoted much time and effort towards elucidating his role in the Muslim philosophical tradition, aside from his celebrated medical treatises. Aspects of Rāzī's philosophical thought have been treated by Prof. Muḥaqqiq in previous publications. This work, however, represents the research summation to date, of his views on this subject.

The book is in Persian; but the author has added a short 2-3 page preface in English describing briefly the contents of every chapter, and has included an article (pp. 5-27) entitled "The 'Spiritual Physic' of Rāzī" which analyses one of Rāzī's works, and which had previously appeared in